

# ***Performance Standards for the Handling and Payment of Commercial Claims by Servicing Carriers***

## **Introduction**

G.L.c.175, §113H requires Commonwealth Automobile Reinsurers (CAR) to establish Performance Standards for Servicing Carriers designed to contain costs, ensure prompt customer service, monitor the payment of legitimate claims, and to resist inflated, fraudulent, and unwarranted claims. G.L.c.175, §113H further provides that the Performance Standards be reviewed two years after such Standards are approved.

The Performance Standards were last approved by the Commissioner of Insurance in her Decision of September 6, 2011 to apply to the Commercial Servicing Carrier Program.

The Performance Standards developed by CAR, require Servicing Carriers to establish and maintain plans and programs to comply with the Standards. In some situations, time frames have been established to ensure prompt customer service.

Measurements of performance and compliance with the Standards are conducted through examinations of claims enhanced by relevant Statistical Plan data and procedures established by CAR. The procedures used to conduct these examinations will follow those outlined in the NAIC Market Conduct Examiners Handbook Chapter VIII G. Claims. Further details are contained in Appendix J CAR Claim Department File Review Process Section 2. Commercial Policies, and the Manual of Administrative Procedures (MAP).

Statistical Plan data including the Average Cost per Claim and Allocated Expense Report is used to supplement the information obtained in the claims file review to evaluate carriers' performance. Servicing Carriers are also required to report savings brought about by SIU activities for physical damage, bodily injury, and personal injury protection claims.

The Performance Standards require and are in addition to compliance with Massachusetts laws and regulations regarding automobile insurance and the CAR Rules of Operation. When revisions to existing laws or regulations or any new laws or regulations relating to claims handling are promulgated, they will become part of the Performance Standards.

The following Appendices are included to assist Servicing Carriers in implementing the Performance Standards:

### **Appendix A – Special Investigative Unit Standards: Section 2 Commercial**

SIU Investigative Standards were developed by CAR to help carriers resist payment of fraudulent claims, deter fraud, control costs, and ultimately help control insurance rates.

### **Appendix B – Regulation 211 CMR 123.00**

#### **Direct Payment of Motor Vehicle Collision and Comprehensive Coverage Claims and Referral Repair Shop Programs**

**Appendix C – Industry Direct Payment Plan for the Settlement of Insured Auto Damage Repairs**

**Appendix D – Decision and Order on the Application for Approval of the Massachusetts Automobile Rating and Accident Prevention Bureau Direct Payment Plan**

**Appendix E – Regulation 212 CMR 2.00  
The Appraisal and Repair of Damaged Motor Vehicles**

Regulation 212 CMR 2.00 promotes public welfare and safety by improving the quality and economy of the appraisal and repair of damaged motor vehicles. It is intended to be read in conjunction with 211 CMR 133.00, which follows in Appendix F.

**Appendix F – Regulation 211 CMR 133.00  
Standards for the Repair of Damaged Motor Vehicles**

Regulation 211 CMR 133.00 promotes the public welfare and safety by establishing fair and uniform standards for the repair of damaged motor vehicles when an insurer pays for the cost of repairs. It is intended to be read in conjunction with 212 CMR 2.00 in Appendix E.

**Appendix G – Regulation 211 CMR 94.00  
Mandatory Pre-Insurance Inspection of Private Passenger Motor Vehicles**

**Appendix H – Salvage Title Law, Chapter 90D, Section 20 (a through e)**

**Appendix I - M.G.L. Chapter 175: Section 24D  
Insurance Claim Payment Intercept Program and  
Regulation 830 CMR 175.24D.1.1  
Intercept of Insurance Payments to Satisfy Child Support Liens**

**Appendix J - CAR Claim Department File Review Process: Section 2. Commercial Policies**

This section incorporates the selection of the sample, review procedures, and criteria to conduct these examinations following the guidelines in the NAIC Market Conduct Examiners Handbook Chapter VIII G. Claims.

**Appendix K - SIU File Review Process: Section 2. Commercial**

CAR's SIU conducts a biennial review of the Servicing Carriers' Special Investigative Unit. The reviews evaluate the adequacy of staffing, quality of investigations, accuracy of reported savings, and compliance with the Standards and reporting requirements.

**Appendix L – Questionnaire: Section 2. Commercial**

The completion of a questionnaire by the Servicing Carriers provides background information on the claim handling programs and procedures established by the carrier to comply with the Standards. Activity indicated on the questionnaire is compared to the activity observed in the Claim Reviews. The Questionnaire will be sent to the Company prior to the commencement of CAR's periodic review.

**Appendix M – Industry Best Practices**

The outline identifies where the industry Best Practices are referenced in the Performance Standards.

**Appendix N – NAIC Standards: Section 2. Commercial**

Reference to NAIC Standards, CAR Rule 10, and the Performance Standards are included.

**Appendix O - DOI 2008-12 Clarification of Coordination of Benefits under MGL c 90, §34A and the Interrelationship by and among PIP, Health Insurance and Medical Payment.**

This bulletin clarifies the coordination of benefits between PIP, Health Insurance, and Medical Payments.

***Performance Standards for the Handling and Payment  
Of Commercial Claims by Servicing Carriers***

**I. Auto Physical Damage & Property Damage Liability Claims**

**A. Auto Body Payments**

**1. Service Times**

- a. Servicing Carriers (hereafter referred to as “carriers”) must establish programs and procedures to ensure prompt settlements of warranted auto physical damage claims.
- b. Carriers must establish procedures to permit prompt inspection of damage at drive-in locations or in the field and to make prompt claim payments of auto physical damage claims.
- c. The Standard for assignment to an appraiser from the date the report is received or date of notice of recovery of theft is 2 business days.
- d. The Standard for transmittal of the completed appraisal from the date of the appraisal assignment is 5 business days in accordance with 212 CMR 2.04(1)(e) (Appendix E).
- e. The Standard for payment of a first party auto physical damage claim under any Direct Payment Plan is 5 business days from completion of the appraisal on all repairable vehicles, subject to all other provisions of the Plan.
- f. The Standard for payment of a first party auto physical damage claim that is not under any Direct Payment Plan is 7 business days following receipt of a Completed Work Claim Form.

**2. Direct Payment Plan**

- a. Carriers must have a Direct Payment Plan unless their average Massachusetts private passenger market share is less than 1 percent of the total Massachusetts commercial market.
  - 1) The Industry Plan can be adopted (Appendix C).
  - 2) Modification to the Industry Plan can be filed for approval by the Commissioner of Insurance.
  - 3) A Carrier can develop its own plan and submit it for approval by the Commissioner of Insurance.
- b. Any Direct Payment Plan developed by a carrier must include a referral shop program.

**3. Parts Cost**

## Commercial Claims Performance Standards

- a. Carriers must have programs and procedures to demonstrate their efforts to obtain discounts and pay less than full retail price for parts.
  - b. Carriers must consider the applicability of aftermarket, rebuilt, and like kind and quality (LKQ) parts on all appropriate appraisals.
  - c. Carriers must allow for, and insist on, the use of aftermarket, rebuilt, and LKQ parts in lieu of new or cost of repair, whenever appropriate.
4. Labor Rates and Times
- a. Carriers must have a plan designed to seek the most competitive labor rates and times, and to determine whether labor rates, repair, and replacement times are reasonable and consistent with industry-recognized sources.
5. Total Loss Payments
- a. Carriers shall not declare any vehicle a total loss when a prudent appraisal evaluation would have shown that the vehicle could have been repaired at an overall cost less than the actual cash value minus the salvage value.
  - b. The actual cash value of any vehicle must be determined based on the requirements of Regulation 211 CMR 133.05 Determination of Value (Appendix G).
    - 1) Actual Cash Value: Whenever the appraised cost of repair plus the probable salvage value may be reasonably expected to exceed the actual cash value of the vehicle, the insurer shall determine the vehicle's actual cash value. This determination shall be based on a consideration of all the following factors:
      - a) the retail book value for a motor vehicle of like kind and quality, but for the damage incurred.
      - b) the price paid for the vehicle plus the value of prior improvements to the motor vehicle at the time of accident, less appropriate depreciation;
      - c) the decrease in value of the motor vehicle resulting from prior unrelated damage which is detected by the appraiser; and
      - d) the actual cost of purchase of an available motor vehicle of like kind and quality but for the damage sustained.
  - c. Existing pre-insurance inspection reports must be reviewed for options, mileage, prior condition, prior damages, and placed in the claim file on all total losses.
  - d. Carriers must be in compliance with the Salvage Title Law, Chapter 90D, section 20 (a through e) (Appendix H).
6. Towing and Storage Costs

## Commercial Claims Performance Standards

- a. Carriers must have a plan to demonstrate that their staffs have knowledge of and enforce all regulations applicable to towing and storage rates and conditions.
  - b. Carriers must have a plan to ensure that non-regulated towing and storage charges are reasonable, or to resist and reduce said charges if they are unreasonable.
  - c. Carriers must have a plan to control storage costs including the prompt disposition of salvage.
7. Appraisal of Damage and Reinspections
- a. Carriers must have basic guidelines for appraisers, which include the following areas:
    - 1) Compliance with Regulation 212 CMR 2.00 – The Appraisal and Repair of Damage Motor Vehicles (Appendix E)
    - 2) Scoping and completing an appraisal
    - 3) Use of aftermarket, rebuilt, LKQ parts
    - 4) Open items and supplements
    - 5) Refinishing
    - 6) Depreciation and betterment
    - 7) Unrelated damage
    - 8) Structural damage
    - 9) ACV estimating
    - 10) Screening for fraudulent claims
  - b. Carriers must have an ongoing training plan and program for continuing education of staff appraisers, including fraud awareness.
  - c. Carriers must have a plan for periodic evaluation of the quality and accuracy of its independent appraisers.
  - d. Reinspections must be completed on 75 percent of all repaired vehicles whose damage exceeded \$4,000 including damages paid under a Direct Payment Plan.
  - e. Reinspections must be completed on 25 percent of all repaired vehicles whose damage was less than \$4,000 including damages paid under a Direct Payment Plan.

8. Carriers must establish procedures to comply with claims requirements included in the mandatory preinsurance inspection program established by Regulation 211 CMR 94.00 (Appendix G).

B. Normal Claim Handling

1. Initial screening of reports of accidents and losses
  - a. All new notices shall be screened by a person with sufficient experience and training to be able to identify warning signs requiring special inquiry or investigation or by an appropriate expert software system designed for fraud screening, and thereafter assigned by a person with sufficient experience and training.
  - b. The initial screening shall determine whether accident circumstances, facts, and information reported are consistent and sufficient to establish the occurrence.
  - c. The initial screening shall identify losses involving theft or arson, which always require detailed investigation.
  - d. The fraud indicators of Commonwealth Automobile Reinsurers Special Investigative Unit (CAR SIU) Standards and Fraud Profile (Appendix A) should be considered to determine possible warning signs of fraud.
  - e. A determination shall be made of the type and extent of further investigation that may be necessary if the initial screening identifies discrepancies or inconsistencies.
2. Initial Investigation

The initial investigation shall include:

- a. Reviewing policy information to verify coverage, resolve any issues including garaging or operators, and notifying Underwriting where appropriate.
  - b. Timely contact with involved parties to secure sufficient documentation of facts involving accident circumstances, to verify occurrence, and to establish degree of fault and, in cases where no injuries reported, appropriate to the loss.
  - c. Obtaining documentation of ownership and existence of said vehicle in appropriate cases, especially total losses.
  - d. Documenting the damages or value of the vehicle.
  - e. Reviewing and evaluating discrepancies and fraud indicators to determine the scope of further investigation.
  - f. Timely setting of reasonable initial reserves and following the documented company policy.
3. Appraisal Program

- a. Appraisers must recognize and report discrepancies which may indicate need for further investigation.
  - b. Appraisals shall be reviewed in conjunction with all other information developed to determine if there are any indicators of fraud.
- 4. Prompt Evaluation and Settlement
  - a. After initial investigation is complete, a decision must be made to promptly process for settlement or refer case for special investigation.
  - b. In the normal course of claim handling a file shall be referred for special investigation or expert analysis when discrepancies exist that are unresolved.
  - c. Carriers shall have a litigation management program designed to bring cases to the earliest conclusion at a reasonable value.
- 5. Prior to making any payment equal to or in excess of \$500 to a third-party claimant the carrier must comply with the requirements of the Insurance Claim Payment Intercept Program, M.G.L. Chapter 175, Section 24D. NOTE: Failure to comply with M.G.L. Chapter 175, Section 24D will subject Company to penalties proscribed by the Department of Revenue. These penalties will be in lieu of those penalties imposed for non compliance with the Performance Standards (see Appendix I).
- 6. Recovery
  - a. The investigation shall determine other parties involved in the accident, the probable extent of liability on each party, and the carrier or party against whom subrogation will be directed, if applicable.
  - b. Upon subrogation recovery the deductible shall be reimbursed in a timely and accurate manner when and where appropriate.

C. Fraud Handling

- 1. Screening process for suspected fraudulent claims
  - a. When a discrepancy is of such weight as to raise substantial questions of fraud (example: all keys accounted for and the vehicle shows no ignition damage), the case shall be referred for special investigation.
  - b. Whenever several discrepancies exist and/or a pattern appears that matches prior suspicious cases, the case shall be referred for special investigation.
  - c. Unresolved discrepancies, such as VIN problems, prior total loss or salvaged vehicle, title inconsistencies, or other verifiable documents shall result in the case being referred for special investigation.
  - d. Whenever a combination of minor discrepancies occur which cannot be resolved, the case shall be referred for special investigation.



2. Appraisal Program

- a. When damage to the vehicle is identified as inconsistent with accident circumstances, the case shall be considered for special investigation.
- b. Clear photographs must accompany explanation of all damage inconsistencies.

3. Special Investigation

- a. Claims identified as suspicious or suspected fraudulent should be referred for more detailed special investigation and consideration given to referring the claim to IFB, NICB and/or the appropriate law enforcement agency for prosecution.
- b. The CAR SIU Standards for investigation of suspicious claims (Appendix A) must be consulted and considered as part of the special investigation process.
- c. The savings recorded on physical damage claims shall be documented and reported to CAR on a quarterly basis.

4. Evaluation and Settlement

After a special investigation is complete, a decision must be made to pay the claim or resist. The claim file must clearly document the basis for the decision and result.

D. Glass

- 1. Carriers must establish a program to effect prompt repair or replacement of damaged or broken glass covered under automobile physical damage coverage, at a fair and competitive cost.
- 2. Carriers must have a plan to screen all glass bills and obtain reasonable discounts on market price lists for all domestic and foreign windshields and all side and back glass.
- 3. Carriers must have a plan to pay labor costs which are reasonable and competitive for glass repair or replacement.
- 4. Carriers must consider a plan to waive any glass deductible if the insured elects to repair the glass damage in lieu of replacement.
- 5. Carriers must have a plan to address fraud, including inspection or reinspection of a representative sampling of all glass losses. In no event shall the selection be based on the age or sex of the policyholder, customary operators of vehicle, or the principal place of garaging of the vehicle.

E. Fraud Training

- 1. Carriers must have a plan that provides for ongoing training on fraud awareness and how to identify suspicious claims.

2. Carriers must have a plan for training on special investigation and handling of suspicious and suspected fraudulent claims.
3. Carriers must have a plan to provide training on claim reporting and fraud recognition to producers and their customer service representatives.

## **II. Bodily Injury & Uninsured/Underinsured Motorist**

### **A. Normal Claim Handling**

1. Initial Screening of Reports of Accident and Losses
  - a. All new notices shall be screened by a person with sufficient experience and training to be able to identify warning signs requiring special inquiry or investigation or by an appropriate expert software system designed for fraud screening, and thereafter assigned by a person with sufficient experience and training.
  - b. The initial screening shall determine whether the accident circumstances, facts, and information reported are consistent and sufficient to establish the occurrence.
  - c. The initial screening shall include checking policy information and accident history, and reporting to Central Index Bureau (CIB) to evaluate for possible warning signs.
  - d. The fraud indicators of the CAR Fraud Profile shall also be considered for possible warning signs.
  - e. A determination shall be made of the type and extent of further investigation that may be necessary if the initial screening identifies discrepancies or inconsistencies.
2. Initial Investigation

The initial investigation shall include:

- a. Reviewing policy information to verify coverage and resolve any coverage issues. Reservation of Right letters and Excess of Loss letters shall be used when and where appropriate.
- b. Contacting involved parties and securing sufficient documentation of facts involving the accident circumstances to verify occurrence and to establish degree of fault.
- c. Securing documentation to verify that all alleged injured parties were actually involved in the accident.
- d. Reviewing and evaluating discrepancies and fraud indicators to determine scope of further investigation.

- e. Timely setting of reasonable initial reserves and following the documented company policy.

3. Contacts

- a. Injured persons or their legal representative making a claim shall be contacted within 2 business days of receipt of notice of injury for purposes of investigation and verification.
- b. The named insured, if not an injured party, shall be contacted within 3 business days of receipt of notice of injury for purposes of investigation and verification.
- c. The insured operator, if not one of the above, shall be contacted within 3 business days of receipt of notice of injury for purposes of investigation and verification.

4. Loss Management

- a. Loss management, assessment, and verification tools shall be used when appropriate to identify the disability claimed, the medical treatment, and whether the treatment and medical expenses are reasonable, necessary, and related to the auto accident.

5. Follow-Up and Continuing Investigation

The continuing investigation shall include:

- a. Verifying and evaluating the type and extent of injury substantiated by available reports and/or independent examinations.
- b. Confirming and documenting that treatment and expenses are reasonable, necessary, and related to the accident.
- c. Reviewing and evaluating discrepancies and fraud indicators to determine the scope of further investigation.
- d. Employing proper diary systems and ensuring ARC reporting and authority levels are followed.
- e. Timely and reasonable changes to the reserves that follow the documented company policy.

6. Settlement Negotiations or Denial

- a. Carriers shall have a settlement evaluation plan to obtain reasonable negotiated settlements of warranted claims. Settlements shall be within approved range or the reason clearly documented if exceeded.
- b. Settlements shall be evaluated and pursued when the injury and expense end result can be established.

## Commercial Claims Performance Standards

- c. Mitigating factors that may reduce settlement value, such as comparative negligence or joint tortfeasor situations shall be evaluated.
- d. Unwarranted or fraudulent claims shall be resisted and denied.
- e. In the normal course of claim handling, a file shall be referred for special investigation or expert analysis when discrepancies exist that are unresolved.
- f. Underinsured motorist claims shall document when no other party is identified as liable.

### 7. Cases in Suit

- a. Carriers shall have a litigation management program designed to bring cases to the earliest conclusion at a reasonable value.
- b. Reservation of Right letters and Excess of Loss letters shall be used when and where appropriate.
- c. Suit referral shall be timely and assigned to appropriate counsel.
- d. Evaluation, case strategy, and legal action plan shall be documented.
- e. Legal bills shall be reviewed for accuracy and reasonableness.
- f. Carriers shall have an Alternative Dispute Resolution Program.

### 8. Prior to making any payment equal to or in excess of \$500 to a third-party claimant the carrier must comply with the requirements of the Insurance Claim Payment Intercept Program, M.G.L. Chapter 175, Section 24D. NOTE: Failure to comply with M.G.L. Chapter 175, Section 24D will subject the company to penalties proscribed by the Department of Revenue. These penalties will be in lieu of those penalties imposed for non compliance with the Performance Standards (Appendix I).

### 9. Recovery

- a. The investigation shall determine other parties involved in the accident, the probable extent of liability on each party, and the carrier or party against whom subrogation will be directed, if applicable.

## B. Fraud Handling

### 1. Screening Process for Suspected Fraudulent Claims

- a. If in the course of the screening process or initial investigation discrepancies develop of a sufficiently serious nature or there are indications of potential fraud, such as:

Accident of unusual circumstances  
Severity of accident  
Unusual number of injured passengers

Prior index history  
Recognition of a pattern related to prior cases of fraud  
(See Appendix A for other indicators)

The case shall be referred for special investigation.

2. Special Investigation

- a. Claims identified as suspicious or suspected fraudulent shall be referred for more detailed special investigation and consideration given to referring the claim to IFB, NICB, or appropriate law enforcement agency for prosecution.
- b. The CAR SIU Standards for investigation of suspicious claims must be consulted and considered as part of the special investigation process.
- c. Carriers shall have a plan designed to deal with claims involving exaggerated damages or injuries, such as inflated doctors' bills or wage statements, and such plan should provide a strategy for concluding those cases at a reasonable amount, as well as reporting the same to the Detail Claim Database (DCD) at AIB. Savings realized from this process should be documented on the SIU Quarterly Log.
- d. Legal expenses incurred shall be itemized, monitored, and related to the claim being paid.

3. Evaluation and Settlement

After a special investigation is complete, a decision must be made to pay the claim or resist. The file shall clearly document the basis for the decision and result.

C. Fraud Training

1. Carriers must have a plan that provides for ongoing training on fraud awareness and how to identify suspicious claims.
2. Carriers must have a plan for training on special investigation and handling of suspicious and suspected fraudulent claims.
3. Carriers must have a plan to provide training on claim reporting and fraud recognition to producers and their customer service representatives.

**III. No-Fault Personal Injury Protection Benefits Handling**

A. Screening Reports and Initial Investigation

1. All new notices shall be screened by a person with sufficient experience and training to be able to identify warning signs requiring special inquiry or investigation or by an appropriate expert software system designed for fraud screening, and thereafter assigned by a person with sufficient experience and training.
2. Initial investigation should confirm that coverage is appropriate:

## Commercial Claims Performance Standards

- a. The date of loss is within policy period and all policy coverage is in order.
  - b. Injured persons are eligible for no-fault benefits.
  - c. Private health insurance availability shall be verified and documented.
  - d. Injuries arise from use of motor vehicle.
  - e. Massachusetts's statute applies.
  - f. No exclusions apply, such as drunk driving, stolen car, and workers compensation.
3. The setting of initial and subsequent reserves shall be timely, reasonable, and follow documented company policy.

### B. Contacts

1. Injured persons or their legal representative making a claim shall be contacted within 2 business days of the carrier's receipt of notice of injury for purposes of investigation and verification.
2. The named insured, if not an injured party, shall be contacted within 3 business days of the carrier's receipt of notice of injury for purposes of investigation and verification.
3. The insured operator, if not identified in B.1 or B.2, shall be contacted within 3 business days of the carrier's receipt of notice of injury for purposes of investigation and verification.
4. Necessary forms shall be mailed or, if preferred by the injured party, electronically sent to the address specified within 5 business days after notice of injury.

### C. Medical Management

1. Carriers must establish a plan to maintain a continuing awareness of the disability claimed, the medical treatment, and whether the treatment and medical expenses are reasonable, necessary, and related to the auto accident.
2. The plan shall include historically utilized techniques such as timely independent medical examinations, medical bill reviews including but not limited to a determination of usual and customary charges, use of preferred provider organizations, managed care programs, and/or expert medical systems, as well as innovative approaches.

### D. Fraud Handling

1. Screening Process for Suspected Fraudulent Claims

## Commercial Claims Performance Standards

If in the course of the screening process or initial investigation discrepancies develop of a sufficiently serious nature or there are indications of potential fraud, such as:

- Accident of unusual circumstances
- Severity of accident
- Unusual number of injured passengers
- Prior index history
- Recognition of a pattern related to prior cases of fraud
- (See Appendix A for other indicators)

the case shall be referred for special investigation and consideration given to referring the claim to IFB, NICB, and/or appropriate law enforcement agency for prosecution.

### E. Subrogation

1. The initial contact and investigation shall determine other parties involved in the accident, the probable extent of liability on each party, and the carrier against which subrogation may be directed. If applicable, a preliminary notice of subrogation shall be sent to the other carrier.
2. In cases of injury serious enough to exceed the tort threshold, the no-fault carrier shall alert the tort carrier immediately.

### F. Claim Payment

1. There shall be no payment until the reported loss has been verified and:
  - a. The deductible applied if applicable.
  - b. Benefits coordinated in conjunction with existing health carrier and wage continuation plans.
  - c. Medical bills verified prior to payment and reviewed for reasonableness, medical necessity, and relationship to the accident.
  - d. Wage rate/working hours verified with employer, using wage/salary verification forms.
  - e. Lost wages confirmed by employer's statement as to time missed and by physician's statement verifying disability for that period of time.
  - f. Investigations promptly conducted. Upon agreement to pay, checks shall be issued within 10 business days.
  - g. A litigation management program designed to bring cases to the earliest conclusion at a reasonable value.
  - h. Legal expenses incurred are itemized, monitored, and related to the claim being paid.

## Commercial Claims Performance Standards

2. In the normal course of claim handling, a file shall be referred for special investigation when discrepancies exist that are unresolved (see list of indicators in Appendix A).
3. Evaluation and Settlement

After a special investigation is complete, a decision must be made to pay the claim or resist. The file shall clearly document the basis for the decision and result.

### IV. Voluntary/Ceded Claim Handling Differential

- A. Ceded claims must be processed with the same degree of diligence as voluntary claims.
- B. CAR will conduct biennial audits of claims using a random sample in order to evaluate and compare the individual carrier performance on the handling of ceded and voluntary claims. Statistical testing will be performed to determine if there is any statistically significant difference in the handling of voluntary and ceded claims by the Servicing Carrier.
- C. The audit shall include voluntary retained policies in order to determine if there is a difference in claims handling between policies insured voluntarily and those ceded through CAR.

### V. Expenses

- A. Carriers must establish a program with guidelines that control claim adjustment expenses.
- B. Carriers must establish guidelines to control legal defense costs:
  1. Evaluation, case strategy, and legal action plan shall be documented.
  2. Legal bills shall be reviewed for accuracy and reasonableness.
  3. Carriers shall have an Alternative Dispute Resolution Program.
- C. Carriers must establish a program to review vendor bills for accuracy, and deduct for unauthorized services.
- D. Carriers must report allocated expenses properly as defined in the Statistical Plan and Manual of Administrative Procedures. Extra contractual expenses and unallocated expenses shall not be reported as allocated expenses.



## Measurements & Penalties

### Measurements

G.L.c.175 §113H requires that CAR propose rules to govern the application of penalties for, among other things, the failure to meet the Performance Standards for the Handling and Payment of Claims by Servicing Carriers.

The following Performance Standards, approved by the Commissioner of Insurance apply to the Commercial Servicing Carrier Program.

Measurements of performance and compliance with the Standards are conducted through examinations of claims enhanced by relevant Statistical Plan data and procedures established by CAR. The completion of a questionnaire by the Servicing Carriers prior to the biennial review provides background information on the claim handling programs established by the carrier to comply with the Standards. This will be supplemented at the time of the examination by a review of company internal documentation including but not limited to claim manuals, reserving and claim settlement procedures, and internal audits. In addition to Statistical Plan data, Servicing Carriers are required to report savings brought about by SIU activities for physical damage, bodily injury, and personal injury protection claims.

Servicing Carriers are evaluated on the effectiveness of their claim handling in meeting industry best practices as well as for their compliance with the Performance Standards and the NAIC Standards. Carriers are measured against the benchmarks listed and industry averages as well as their own prior performance. Both quantitative and qualitative aspects of the claims process are evaluated. The most readily quantifiable standards are the ones that involve specific time frames, averages, and counts. Other standards are qualitative such as reserving, medical management, evaluation, and settlement. The benchmark for compliance with the best practices and standards is 80%. The measurements for glass, reinspections, and ICPIP are set at MA statutory levels.

If it is determined that a Servicing Carrier is not in compliance on ceded files with the Performance Standards the CAR Claim Department will then determine the degree to which the non-compliance exists in the following areas addressed by the Standards. Specifically, the areas are:

- I. Auto Physical Damage & Property Damage Liability Claims
- II. Bodily Injury & Uninsured/Underinsured Motorist
- III. No Fault Personal Injury Protection Benefits
- V. Expenses

For Section IV. Voluntary/Ceded Claim Handling Differential, CAR will evaluate and compare the individual company performance on the handling of ceded and voluntary claims. Statistical testing will be performed to determine if there is any statistically significant difference in the handling of voluntary and ceded claims by the Servicing Carrier. If CAR determines that the company is in non-compliance with the Voluntary/Ceded Claims Handling Differential Standard a penalty will be assessed.

Minor non-compliance indicates that a carrier is not in compliance with the Standards in one or more areas but the quality of claim handling is unaffected and no overpayments result from this situation.

## Commercial Claims Performance Standards

Major non-compliance indicates that a carrier has failed the Standards in one or more area. Claim handling is affected and overpayments may be occurring as a result. The carrier will be notified of the extent and areas in which non-compliance exists and will be warned that the subsequent review of the carrier must reflect compliance in all of the cited areas to avoid penalty.

If in the review subsequent to being warned of major non-compliance a carrier remains in non-compliance but has improved its claim handling practices significantly, a Type I penalty will be assessed for the area in which this non-compliance exists.

If in the review subsequent to being warned of major non-compliance a carrier fails to improve its claim handling practices, a Type II penalty will be assessed for the area in which this non-compliance exists.

One penalty will be assessed in each of the following sections of the Standards in which major non-compliance is found:

- I. Auto Physical Damage & Property Damage Liability Claims
- II. Bodily Injury & Uninsured/Underinsured Motorist
- III. No Fault Personal Injury Protection Benefits
- IV. Voluntary/Ceded Claim Handling Differential
- V. Expenses

The amount of the penalty will be determined by the type of penalty using the following Schedule of Penalties.

In the event that non-compliance continues beyond two years, the penalties will increase for the third year according to the Schedule of Penalties. In the fourth year of non compliance the Carrier would be referred to the Governing Committee for possible termination.

Should a carrier achieve compliance after being penalized for non-compliance with the Standards, it must maintain compliance for two years before it is returned to pre-warning status.

Should a carrier disagree with the findings of the CAR Compliance Audit Department, it will notify the Vice President of Compliance Audit and a meeting will be held to discuss the findings. If agreement cannot be reached, the carrier may appeal the decision to the Governing Committee in accordance with Rule 20.

Schedule of Penalties			
Type I Penalty by Year			
1st Year	2nd Year	3rd Year	4th Year
Warning	\$6,000	\$30,000	Governing Committee
Type II Penalty by Year			
1st Year	2nd Year	3rd Year	4th Year
Warning	\$20,000	\$100,000	Governing Committee

## Commercial Claims Performance Standards

The compliance status of the Commercial Servicing Carriers will be reported to the Compliance Audit Committee, Governing Committee, and the Division of Insurance.

The following benchmarks and measurements are utilized to compare the Servicing Carrier's performance to the Industry on commercial claims handling. Except where noted, the benchmarks for compliance is 80%.

Best Practices	NAIC Standard	Measurement	Benchmark
Physical Damage/Property Damage			
Assignment/Contact	NAIC 1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Appropriate assignment &amp; contact to establish loss fact</li> </ul>	
Coverage	NAIC 3, 7	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Coverage verified, garaging, operator issues resolved if applicable</li> </ul>	
Appraisal	NAIC 6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Appraisal assignment within 2 business days.</li> <li>Transmittal of appraisal within 2 business days.</li> <li>Quality of appraisal - Aftermarket/LKQ, betterment, screening for fraud, photos, recognition of fraud, and cause &amp; origin.</li> </ul>	
Reserving	NAIC 10	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Timely, reasonable, follow documented company policy.</li> </ul>	
Screening and Investigation	NAIC 2, 3, 6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Screening for fraud, recognition of fraud indicators.</li> <li>Timely investigation.</li> <li>Liability apportioned correctly.</li> </ul>	
Settlement	NAIC 3, 6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Depreciation and ACV calculations appropriate.</li> <li>Salvage disposal proper.</li> <li>On property damage, comparative negligence recognized.</li> <li>Payment within 5 days under Direct Payment Plan; 7 days CWCF.</li> </ul>	
Subrogation	NAIC 8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Subrogation recognized and pursued.</li> <li>Reimbursement of deductible is timely and accurate when and where appropriate.</li> </ul>	
Reinspections	NAIC 6, 9	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Compliance with Regulation 211 CMR 2.</li> </ul>	75%>\$4,000; 25%<\$4,000
Glass	NAIC 6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Program for repair of glass in place.</li> <li>Carrier tracks percent of repair.</li> </ul>	100%
Litigation Management	NAIC 13	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Bring cases to the earliest conclusion at a reasonable value.</li> </ul>	
No Fault Personal Injury Protection Claims			
Contact	NAIC 1, 9	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Injured party - 2 days.</li> <li>Uninjured party - 3 days.</li> <li>PIP form mailing - 5 days.</li> </ul>	

Best Practices	NAIC Standard	Measurement	Benchmark
Reserving	NAIC 10	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Initial and subsequent reserves timely and appropriate; follow documented company policy</li> </ul>	
Medical Management	NAIC 4, 5, 6, 11	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Claims warranting IME referral vs. claims referred for IME.</li> <li>Appropriate utilization of IME results to cut off claim, reduce bills.</li> <li>Appropriate utilization of Medical Bill Review program.</li> </ul>	
Loss Management/Special Investigation	NAIC 4, 11	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Claims warranting special investigation vs. claims referred for special investigation.</li> </ul>	
Subrogation	NAIC 8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Subrogation recognized and pursued.</li> <li>Reimbursement of deductible is timely and accurate when and where appropriate.</li> </ul>	
Bodily Injury/Uninsured Motorist Claims			
Contact	NAIC 1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Injured party - 2 days.</li> <li>Uninjured party - 3 days.</li> </ul>	
Reserves	NAIC 10	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Initial and subsequent reserves timely and appropriate; follow documented company policy</li> </ul>	
Loss Management/Special Investigation	NAIC 4, 11	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Claims warranting special investigation vs. claims referred for special investigation.</li> </ul>	
Litigation Management	NAIC 7, 13	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Reservation of Rights and Excess letters used when and where appropriate.</li> </ul>	
Settlement	NAIC 3, 5, 6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Evaluation range documented and appropriate.</li> <li>Settlement within range or documented why exceeded.</li> </ul>	
Recovery	NAIC 3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Recovery potential recognized and pursued.</li> <li>Contribution from joint tortfeasor obtained.</li> </ul>	
Voluntary/Ceded Claim Handling Differential			
Claim Handling	NAIC 6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A comparison of the compliance results for each of the resolution standards in the Ceded and Voluntary claims will be calculated.</li> <li>Statistical testing will be performed on the aggregate results of each of the three applicable sections: Physical Damage/Property Damage, PIP, and BI.</li> </ul>	

## Commercial Claims Performance Standards

Best Practices	NAIC Standard	Measurement	Benchmark
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• If the difference is statistically significant, the carrier will be required to address the reasons in their response.</li> <li>• Following the response, CAR will make a determination on whether the Voluntary/Ceded Standard was in compliance.</li> </ul>	
Expenses	NAIC 14	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Reported properly as defined in the Statistical Plan.</li> </ul>	