

COMMONWEALTH AUTOMOBILE REINSURERS

MASSACHUSETTS

COMMERCIAL

AUTOMOBILE EXPERIENCE RATING PLAN

Effective November 1, 2022

**Printed and Distributed by
Commonwealth Automobile Reinsurers
101 Arch Street
Boston, MA 02110**

This Experience Rating Plan is designed and its rating parameters have been calculated using experience for basic limits Bodily Injury Liability (BI), Personal Injury Protection (PIP), and Property Damage Liability (PDL). Premises and operations liability is also included for garage risks. Therefore, the premiums and losses used in deriving the experience modification for any risk under this Plan should include data from only these coverages.

A. ELIGIBILITY

The term risk as used in this Plan means the exposures of any one insured which are to be rated. Allied or subsidiary interests shall not be included unless:

1. The insured holds a majority financial interest therein, or
2. The following conditions exist under an exclusive franchise arrangement between the franchise grantor and the other interests to be rated:
 - a. all interests operate under a common trade name, and
 - b. all interests use one or more identical products or services obtained through the franchise grantor, and
 - c. one source establishes and maintains standards regarding management control and is responsible for insurance premium payment for all interests operating under the exclusive franchise, and
 - d. there is no legal prohibition against ownership by the franchise grantor of the operations of the other interests to be rated.

Expenses other than allocated loss adjustment expenses are not taken into consideration in the parameters of this Plan.

Any risk meeting the following qualifications for the BI, PIP, and PDL exposure to be rated shall be eligible for the application of this Plan:

- (1) Five or more private passenger or commercial automobiles, one or more taxicabs, three or more public automobiles of any other type, or five or more plates of any type for risks which include registration plates not issued for a specific automobile such as garage risks, or the equivalent of such exposures for automobiles hired by the risk, or
- (2) Annual basic limits manual premium of at least \$2,500, including premises and operations premium, for garage risks not subject to the Massachusetts Compulsory Law, or for employers non-ownership

liability exposure. Note that the headquarters location of the risk shall govern the application of this Plan for all employers non-ownership liability exposures regardless of location.

B. EXPERIENCE MODIFICATION

The experience modification for the risk shall be determined in accordance with the experience rating procedure described herein and shall be applied to the total current manual premium, including all increased limits, and premises and operations for garage risks for the BI, PIP, and PDL coverages on the policy being rated.

C. EXPERIENCE USED

The experience modification shall be determined, by the company establishing the rating, from the latest available three completed policy years of experience incurred in this state, or in all states by the risk. In the event the experience for the full experience period is not available, at least two completed policy years shall be used. Risks with less than two completed policy years of experience shall not be experience rated. The experience period shall end at least six months prior to the rating date.

Experience developed by companies other than the company establishing the modification or self-insured experience may be used subject to the periods specified above. If the risk has been self-insured or insured with a company from which the experience is not obtainable, the experience may be used if submitted to the company in the form of a statement signed by the insured. Experience in such form may be excluded from the rating if its reliability can not be established.

D. DETERMINATION OF EXPERIENCE MODIFICATION

The term basic limits shall mean \$20,000/40,000 BI, \$8,000 PIP, and \$5,000 PDL.

1. Total Basic Limits Premium Subject to Experience Rating

The premiums to be included in the rating are calculated as follows:

- a. Determine the current annual basic limits premium for BI, PIP and PDL for the policy being rated using CAR's current manual rates. The policy being rated is the policy to which the experience modification of D.6. of this Section shall apply.

- b. The annual basic limits premium for each year of the experience period is the annual basic limits premium determined according to D.1.a. of this Section, multiplied by the appropriate detrend factor from Table A of this Section.

Liability Experience Rating Plan Factors
Table A – Premium Detrend Factors

	<u>Latest Year</u>	^{2nd} <u>Latest Year</u>	^{3rd} <u>Latest Year</u>
Taxi	0.924	0.890	0.859
All Other	0.921	0.886	0.854

- c. The total basic limits premium subject to experience rating is equal to the sum of the detrended annual basic limits premiums calculated according to D.1.b. of this Section.
- d. If exposures have changed during the experience period, refer to the supplement to determine if an alternative rating methodology is in order.

2. Basic Limits Losses Subject to Experience Rating

The losses to be included in the rating shall be the total of the following:

- a. Paid and outstanding losses, including allocated loss adjustment expense (ALAE) for each year in the experience period, with the indemnity amount limited to basic limits, and with the amount of indemnity and allocated loss adjustment expense resulting from any single occurrence limited by the maximum single loss (MSL) value specified in Table C of this Section based on the total basic limits premium subject to experience rating.

Property damage losses and ALAE from the experience period shall be adjusted to the deductible basis, if any, that applies for the policy being rated.

- b. Adjustment to reflect ultimate level of losses for each year in the experience period, is calculated by multiplying the annual basic limits premium from D.1.b. of this Section for the year by the adjusted expected loss ratio (AELR) and by the appropriate basic limits loss development factor (LDF). The formula for this adjustment is $P \times AELR \times LDF$, where
 - (1) P is the annual basic limits premium for the particular year in the experience period from D.1.b. of this Section.

- (2) AELR is the adjusted expected loss ratio specified in Table C of this Section based on the total basic limits premium subject to experience rating from D.1.c. of this Section. If a risk includes more than one vehicle type, then the AELR from Table C of this Section should be the AELR for the predominant class of risk on the policy.
- (3) LDF is the appropriate CAR basic limits loss development factor from Table B of this Section.

Liability Experience Rating Plan Factors
Table B – Loss Development Factors

	<u>Latest Year</u>		<u>2nd Latest Year</u>		<u>3rd Latest Year</u>		<u>Factors for Immature Years*</u>	
	Taxi	All Other	Taxi	All Other	Taxi	All Other	Taxi	All Other
Maturity (Months)	18	18	30	30	42	42	6	6
LDF	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.511	0.586
Maturity (Months)	21	21	33	33	45	45	9	9
LDF	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.225	0.332
Maturity (Months)	24	24	36	36	48	48	12	12
LDF	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.071
Maturity (Months)	27	27	39	39	51	51	15	15
LDF	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000

* In cases where an insured has changed carriers, the company establishing the rating may be unable to obtain current valuations of past losses from previous carriers. Therefore losses may be evaluated at less than 18 months.

The maturity of the losses for any year in the experience period is defined as the number of months between the latest loss valuation and the effective date of the policy to which these losses are assignable.

3. Actual Loss Ratio

Determine the actual loss ratio (ALR) by dividing the basic limits losses subject to experience rating from D.2.a. and D.2.b. of this Section by the total basic limits premium subject to experience rating from D.1.c. of this Section.

4. Credibility

The credibility for the risk is obtained from Table C of this Section, based on the total basic limits premium subject to experience rating.

5. Adjusted Expected Loss Ratio

The AELR for the risk is obtained from Table C of this Section based on the total basic limits premium subject to experience rating. If a risk includes more than one vehicle type, then the AELR from Table C of this Section should be the AELR for the predominant class of risk on the policy.

6. Experience Modification

$$\frac{ALR - AELR}{AELR} \times CREDIBILITY = EXPERIENCE \text{ MODIFICATION}$$

If the experience modification is negative, it is a credit; if positive, it is a debit.

LIABILITY EXPERIENCE RATING PLAN EXAMPLE

I. Basic Information

Assume the policy to be rated is effective 10/01/22 – 09/30/23 for private passenger type vehicles.

Assume the basic limits premium for BI, PIP, and PDL using CAR rates effective 10/01/22 is \$25,000.

Assume the losses and ALAE for three years, evaluated as of 10/01/22, are as follows:

<u>Year</u> (1)	<u>Maturity</u> (2)	<u>Total Limits Losses</u> (3)	<u>Basic Limits Losses</u> (4)	<u>ALAE</u> (5)	<u>Basic Limits Losses & ALAE (4) + (5)</u> (6)
10/01/18-09/30/19	48	\$ 1,500 500 100,000	\$ 1,500 500 20,000	\$ 500 100 20,000	\$ 2,000 600 40,000
10/01/19-09/30/20	36	750 250	750 250	100 50	850 300
10/01/20-09/30/21	24	250 500 22,250	250 500 20,000	50 700 5,000	300 1,200 25,000

II. Total Basic Limits Premium Subject to Experience Rating (See D.1. of this Section)

<u>Year</u>	<u>Annual Basic Limits Premium</u>	<u>Table A Detrend Factors</u>	<u>Basic Limits Premium Subject to Experience Rating</u>
(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
3 rd Latest Year	\$ 25,000	0.854	\$ 21,350
2 nd Latest Year	25,000	0.886	22,150
Latest Year	25,000	0.921	<u>23,025</u>
			\$ 66,525

From Table C of this Section, given the total basic limits premium subject to experience rating of \$66,525, the credibility is 0.27, the AELR is 0.606, and the MSL is \$36,802. (See D.1., 2. and 3. of this Section)

III. Basic Limits Losses Subject to Experience Rating

A. Paid and Outstanding Losses & ALAE (See D.2. of this Section)

<u>Year</u>	<u>Basic Limits Losses & ALAE</u>	<u>Basic Limits Losses & ALAE Subject to MSL of \$36,802</u>
(1)	(2)	(3)
10/01/18 – 09/30/19	\$ 2,000 600 40,000	\$ 2,000 600 36,802
10/01/19 – 09/30/20	850 300	850 300
10/01/20 – 09/30/21	300 1,200 25,000	300 1,200 <u>25,000</u>
		\$ 67,052

B. Adjustment to Reflect the Ultimate Level of Losses (See D.2. of this Section)

<u>Year</u> (1)	<u>Maturity</u> (2)	<u>Premium Subject To Experience Rating (Step II)</u> (3)	<u>AELR (Step II)</u> (4)	<u>Table B LDF</u> (5)	<u>Adjustment to Reflect Ultimate Level of Losses (3) x (4) x (5)</u> (6)
10/01/18 – 09/30/19	48	\$ 21,350	0.606	0.000	\$ 0
10/01/19 – 09/30/20	36	22,150	0.606	0.000	0
10/01/20 – 09/30/21	24	<u>23,025</u>	0.606	0.000	<u>0</u>
		\$ 66,525			\$ 0

IV. Experience Modification

Credibility (Step II)	0.27
Adjusted Expected Loss Ratio (Step II)	0.606
Basic Limits Losses Subject to Experience Rating (\$67,052 + \$ 0) (Step III)	\$ 67,052
Basic Limits Premium (Step II)	\$ 66,525
Actual Loss Ratio (\$67,052/66,525)	1.008

$$\text{Experience Modification} = \frac{1.008 - 0.606}{0.606} \times 0.27 = 0.179 \text{ (factor of 1.179) or a 17.9\% debit}$$

Liability Experience Rating Plan Factors
Table C – Credibility, Adjusted Expected Loss Ratios and Maximum Single Losses

<u>Premium Level</u>	<u>Credibility</u>	<u>Adjusted Expected Loss Ratio</u>			<u>Maximum Single Loss</u>
		<u>Taxicabs</u>	<u>Zone Rated</u>	<u>All Other</u>	
1,500 - 6,640	0.03	0.523	0.510	0.519	20,000
6,641 - 8,627	0.04	0.539	0.525	0.535	21,783
8,628 - 10,655	0.05	0.549	0.535	0.545	23,044
10,656 - 12,727	0.06	0.556	0.542	0.552	24,001
12,728 - 14,844	0.07	0.561	0.547	0.557	24,827
14,845 - 17,007	0.08	0.566	0.552	0.562	25,544
17,008 - 19,218	0.09	0.570	0.556	0.566	26,196
19,219 - 21,478	0.10	0.574	0.560	0.570	26,826
21,479 - 23,789	0.11	0.577	0.563	0.573	27,413
23,790 - 26,153	0.12	0.580	0.566	0.576	28,000
26,154 - 28,572	0.13	0.583	0.569	0.579	28,565
28,573 - 31,047	0.14	0.586	0.571	0.582	29,130
31,048 - 33,580	0.15	0.588	0.574	0.584	29,673
33,581 - 36,175	0.16	0.591	0.576	0.586	30,238
36,176 - 38,832	0.17	0.593	0.578	0.589	30,803
38,833 - 41,554	0.18	0.595	0.580	0.591	31,368
41,555 - 44,344	0.19	0.597	0.582	0.593	31,933
44,345 - 47,204	0.20	0.599	0.584	0.594	32,498
47,205 - 50,138	0.21	0.601	0.586	0.596	33,085
50,139 - 53,148	0.22	0.602	0.587	0.598	33,694
53,149 - 56,236	0.23	0.604	0.589	0.600	34,281
56,237 - 59,406	0.24	0.606	0.591	0.601	34,890
59,407 - 62,660	0.25	0.607	0.592	0.603	35,520
62,661 - 66,002	0.26	0.609	0.594	0.604	36,150
66,003 - 69,437	0.27	0.611	0.595	0.606	36,802
69,438 - 72,969	0.28	0.612	0.597	0.607	37,454
72,970 - 76,600	0.29	0.613	0.598	0.609	38,128
76,601 - 80,337	0.30	0.615	0.600	0.610	38,824
80,338 - 84,183	0.31	0.616	0.601	0.612	39,520
84,184 - 88,142	0.32	0.618	0.602	0.613	40,237

Liability Experience Rating Plan Factors
Table C – Credibility, Adjusted Expected Loss Ratios and Maximum Single Losses

<u>Premium Level</u>	<u>Credibility</u>	<u>Adjusted Expected Loss Ratio</u>			<u>Maximum Single Loss</u>
		<u>Taxicabs</u>	<u>Zone Rated</u>	<u>All Other</u>	
88,143 - 92,220	0.33	0.619	0.604	0.614	40,976
92,221 - 96,424	0.34	0.620	0.605	0.616	41,737
96,425 - 100,757	0.35	0.622	0.606	0.617	42,498
100,758 - 105,226	0.36	0.623	0.608	0.618	43,302
105,227 - 109,838	0.37	0.624	0.609	0.620	44,106
109,839 - 114,599	0.38	0.626	0.610	0.621	44,936
114,600 - 119,519	0.39	0.627	0.611	0.622	45,801
119,520 - 124,606	0.40	0.628	0.613	0.623	46,671
124,607 - 129,865	0.41	0.629	0.614	0.625	47,584
129,866 - 135,307	0.42	0.631	0.615	0.626	48,497
135,308 - 140,942	0.43	0.632	0.616	0.627	49,475
140,943 - 146,779	0.44	0.633	0.617	0.628	50,453
146,780 - 152,832	0.45	0.634	0.618	0.629	51,475
152,833 - 159,110	0.46	0.635	0.619	0.630	52,518
159,111 - 165,627	0.47	0.636	0.620	0.631	53,605
165,628 - 172,397	0.48	0.637	0.621	0.632	54,735
172,398 - 179,436	0.49	0.637	0.621	0.633	55,887
179,437 - 186,758	0.50	0.638	0.622	0.633	57,104
186,759 - 194,382	0.51	0.639	0.623	0.634	58,343
194,383 - 202,328	0.52	0.639	0.623	0.635	59,647
202,329 - 210,616	0.53	0.640	0.624	0.635	60,973
210,617 - 219,268	0.54	0.641	0.625	0.636	62,386
219,269 - 228,308	0.55	0.641	0.625	0.636	63,842
228,309 - 237,765	0.56	0.642	0.626	0.637	65,342
237,766 - 247,668	0.57	0.642	0.626	0.637	66,929
247,669 - 258,046	0.58	0.643	0.627	0.638	68,581
258,047 - 268,937	0.59	0.643	0.627	0.638	70,298
268,938 - 280,380	0.60	0.644	0.628	0.639	72,124
280,381 - 292,417	0.61	0.644	0.628	0.639	74,015
292,418 - 305,096	0.62	0.645	0.629	0.640	75,993

Liability Experience Rating Plan Factors
Table C – Credibility, Adjusted Expected Loss Ratios and Maximum Single Losses

<u>Premium Level</u>	<u>Credibility</u>	<u>Adjusted Expected Loss Ratio</u>			<u>Maximum Single Loss</u>
		<u>Taxicabs</u>	<u>Zone Rated</u>	<u>All Other</u>	
305,097 - 318,471	0.63	0.645	0.629	0.640	78,080
318,472 - 332,597	0.64	0.646	0.630	0.641	80,275
332,598 - 347,544	0.65	0.646	0.630	0.641	82,601
347,545 - 363,382	0.66	0.647	0.630	0.642	85,057
363,383 - 380,197	0.67	0.647	0.631	0.642	87,644
380,198 - 398,079	0.68	0.647	0.631	0.642	90,405
398,080 - 417,134	0.69	0.648	0.631	0.643	93,318
417,135 - 437,478	0.70	0.648	0.632	0.643	96,426
437,479 - 459,251	0.71	0.648	0.632	0.643	99,730
459,252 - 482,609	0.72	0.649	0.633	0.644	103,317
482,610 - 507,731	0.73	0.649	0.633	0.644	107,078
507,732 - 534,822	0.74	0.649	0.633	0.644	111,165
534,823 - 564,124	0.75	0.650	0.633	0.645	115,556
564,125 - 595,917	0.76	0.650	0.634	0.645	120,316
595,918 - 630,539	0.77	0.650	0.634	0.645	125,468
630,540 - 668,379	0.78	0.651	0.634	0.646	131,076
668,380 - 709,914	0.79	0.651	0.635	0.646	137,206
709,915 - 755,709	0.80	0.651	0.635	0.646	143,923
755,710 - 806,450	0.81	0.651	0.635	0.646	151,335
806,451 - 862,995	0.82	0.652	0.635	0.647	159,552
862,996 - 926,395	0.83	0.652	0.636	0.647	168,682
926,396 - 997,972	0.84	0.652	0.636	0.647	178,942
997,973 - 1,079,420	0.85	0.652	0.636	0.647	190,506
1,079,421 - 1,172,939	0.86	0.653	0.636	0.648	203,679
1,172,940 - 1,281,416	0.87	0.653	0.636	0.648	218,786
1,281,417 - 1,408,760	0.88	0.653	0.637	0.648	236,306
1,408,761 - 1,560,360	0.89	0.653	0.637	0.648	256,891
1,560,361 - 1,743,877	0.90	0.653	0.637	0.648	281,367
1,743,878 - 1,970,579	0.91	0.653	0.637	0.648	311,017
1,970,580 - 2,257,733	0.92	0.654	0.637	0.649	347,623

Liability Experience Rating Plan Factors
Table C – Credibility, Adjusted Expected Loss Ratios and Maximum Single Losses

<u>Premium Level</u>	<u>Credibility</u>	<u>Adjusted Expected Loss Ratio</u>			<u>Maximum Single Loss</u>
		<u>Taxicabs</u>	<u>Zone Rated</u>	<u>All Other</u>	
2,257,734 - 2,633,237	0.93	0.654	0.637	0.649	394,010
2,633,238 - 3,145,291	0.94	0.654	0.637	0.649	454,657
3,145,292 - 3,884,927	0.95	0.654	0.638	0.649	537,346
3,884,928 - 5,047,205	0.96	0.654	0.638	0.649	656,792
5,047,206 - 7,139,307	0.97	0.654	0.638	0.649	844,493
7,139,308 - 12,020,880	0.98	0.654	0.638	0.649	1,182,355
12,020,881- 36,428,755	0.99	0.654	0.638	0.649	1,970,700
36,428,756 and Over	1.00	0.654	0.638	0.649	5,912,383

A. ELIGIBILITY

The term risk as used in this Plan means the exposures of any one insured which are to be rated. Allied or subsidiary interests shall not be included unless:

1. The insured holds a majority financial interest therein, or
2. The following conditions exist under an exclusive franchise arrangement between the franchise grantor and the other interests to be rated:
 - a. all interests operate under a common trade name, and
 - b. all interests use one or more identical products or services obtained through the franchise grantor, and
 - c. one source establishes and maintains standards regarding management control and is responsible for insurance premium payment for all interests operating under the exclusive franchise, and
 - d. there is no legal prohibition against ownership by the franchise grantor of the operations of the other interests to be rated.

Expenses are not taken into consideration in the parameters of this Plan.

Any risk meeting the following qualifications for the Fire, Theft, Combined Additional Coverage, Comprehensive, Collision, Limited Collision, Garagekeepers Legal Liability and Dealers Physical Damage exposure to be rated shall be eligible for the application of this Plan:

- (1) Five or more owned or hired automobiles, including trailers and semitrailers, which develop an annual premium of at least \$1,500,
or
- (2) If a garage, and has an annual manual premium of at least \$1,500,
or
- (3) Any taxicab risk which develops an annual premium of at least \$1,000 irrespective of the number of vehicles comprising the risk.

EXCEPTION

Where five or more bodies are under one ownership and the chassis are under other ownership, such a risk shall be eligible for rating either for the bodies only or for the bodies and the chassis regardless of the ownership of the chassis.

Where the bodies only of such a risk are to be rated the number of bodies shall be used to determine eligibility.

Where both the chassis and the bodies are to be rated, a chassis and body shall be considered one complete unit and the bodies in excess thereof shall be used in addition to the number of complete units for determining eligibility.

B. EXPERIENCE MODIFICATION

The experience modification for the risk shall be determined in accordance with the experience rating procedure described herein, and shall be applied to current manual premium for the Fire, Theft, Combined Additional Coverage, Comprehensive, Collision and Limited Collision coverages and deductibles included in the policy being rated.

C. EXPERIENCE USED

The experience modification shall be determined, by the company establishing the rating, from the latest available three completed policy years of experience incurred in this state or in all states by the risk. In the event the experience for the full experience period is not available, at least two completed policy years shall be used. Risks with less than two completed policy years of experience shall not be experience rated. The experience period shall end at least six months prior to the rating date.

Experience developed by companies other than the company establishing the modification or self-insured experience may be used subject to the periods specified above. If the risk has been self-insured or insured with a company from which the experience is not obtainable, the experience may be used if submitted to the company in the form of a statement signed by the insured. Experience in such form may be excluded from the rating if its reliability cannot be established.

D. DETERMINATION OF EXPERIENCE MODIFICATION

The experience modification shall be determined by application of the following procedure:

1. Total Premium Subject to Experience Rating

The premiums to be included in the rating are calculated as follows:

- a. Determine the current annual premium for the policy being rated using CAR's current manual rates. The policy being rated is the policy to which the experience modification of D.7. of this Section shall apply.
- b. The annual premium for each year of the experience period is the annual premium determined according to D.1.a. of this Section, multiplied by the appropriate detrend factor from Table A of this Section.

Physical Damage Experience Rating Plan Factors
Table A – Premium Detrend Factors

<u>Latest Year</u>	^{2nd} <u>Latest Year</u>	^{3rd} <u>Latest Year</u>
0.918	0.883	0.850

- c. The total premium subject to experience rating is equal to the sum of the detrended annual premiums calculated according to D.1.b. of this Section.
- d. If exposures have changed during the experience period, refer to the supplement to determine if an alternative rating methodology is in order.

2. Losses Subject to Experience Rating

The losses to be included in the rating shall be the total of the following:

- a. Paid and outstanding losses, excluding allocated loss adjustment expense (ALAE), for each year in the experience period, with the amount of indemnity resulting from any single occurrence limited by the maximum single loss (MSL) value specified in Table C of this Section based on the total premium subject to experience rating. All losses from the experience period shall be adjusted to the deductible basis of the policy being rated.
- b. In cases where an insured has changed carriers, the company establishing the rating may be unable to obtain current valuations of past losses from

previous carriers. Therefore losses may be evaluated at less than 18 months.

In these cases, an adjustment to reflect ultimate level of losses for each year in the experience period is needed. This adjustment is calculated by multiplying the annual premium from D.1.b. of this Section for the year by the adjusted expected loss ratio (AELR) and by the appropriate loss development factor (LDF). The formula for this adjustment is $P \times AELR \times LDF$, where

- (1) P is the annual premium for the particular year in the experience period from D.1.b. of this Section.
- (2) AELR is the adjusted expected loss ratio specified in Table C of this Section based on the total premium subject to experience rating from D.1.c. of this Section. If a risk includes more than one vehicle type, then the AELR from Table C of this Section should be the AELR for the predominant class of risk on the policy.
- (3) LDF is the appropriate CAR basic limits loss development factor from Table B of this Section.

Physical Damage Experience Rating Plan Factors
Table B – Loss Development Factors

	Factors for <u>Immature Years</u>
Maturity (Months)	6
LDF	0.500
Maturity (Months)	9
LDF	0.242
Maturity (Months)	12
LDF	0.000
Maturity (Months)	15
LDF	0.000

The maturity of the losses for any year in the experience period is defined as the number of months between the latest loss valuation and the effective date of the policy to which these losses are assignable.

3. Actual Loss Ratio

Determine the actual loss ratio (ALR) by dividing the losses subject to experience rating from D.2.a. and D.2.b. of this Section by the total premium subject to experience rating from D.1.c. of this Section.

4. Credibility

The credibility for the risk is obtained from Table C of this Section based on the total premium subject to experience rating.

5. Adjusted Expected Loss Ratio

The adjusted expected loss ratio (AELR) for the risk is obtained from Table C of this Section based on the total premium subject to experience rating. If a risk includes more than one vehicle type, then the AELR from Table C of this Section should be the AELR for the predominant class of risk on the policy.

6. Experience Rating Adjustment Factor

The Experience Rating Adjustment Factor (ERAF) is a component applied to each calculation of the experience modification. The factor is 0.20.

7. Experience Modification

$$\frac{ALR - AELR}{AELR} \times CREDIBILITY \times ERAF = \text{EXPERIENCE MODIFICATION}$$

If the experience modification is negative, it is a credit; if positive, it is a debit.

PHYSICAL DAMAGE EXPERIENCE RATING PLAN EXAMPLE

I. Basic Information

Assume the policy to be rated is effective 10/01/22 – 09/30/23 for private passenger type vehicles.

Assume the basic limits premium for OTC and collision using CAR rates effective 10/01/22 is \$15,000.

Assume the losses for three years, evaluated as of 10/01/21 are as follows:

<u>Year</u> (1)	<u>Maturity</u> (2)	<u>Losses</u> (3)
10/01/18 – 09/30/19	48	\$ 200 300
10/01/19 – 09/30/20	36	250 12,000
10/01/20 – 09/30/21	24	300 200 250

II. Total Basic Limits Premium Subject to Experience Rating (See D.1. of this Section)

<u>Year</u> (1)	<u>Annual Basic Limits Premium</u> (2)	<u>Table A Detrend Factors</u> (3)	<u>Basic Limits Premium Subject to Experience Rating</u> (4)
3 rd Latest Year	\$ 15,000	0.850	\$ 12,750
2 nd Latest Year	15,000	0.883	13,245
Latest Year	15,000	0.918	13,770
			\$ 39,765

From Table C of this Section, given the total basic limits premium subject to experience rating of \$39,765, the credibility is 0.45, the AELR is 0.495, and the MSL is \$10,250. (See D.2., 3. and 4. of this Section)

III. Losses Subject to Experience Rating (See D.2. of this Section)

A. Paid and Outstanding Losses

<u>Year</u>	<u>Losses</u>	<u>Losses Subject to MSL of \$10,250</u>
(1)	(2)	(3)
10/01/18 – 09/30/19	\$ 200 300	\$ 200 300
10/01/19 – 09/30/20	250 12,000	250 10,250
10/01/20 – 09/30/21	300 200 250	300 200 <u>250</u>
		\$ 11,750

IV. Experience Modification

Credibility (Step II)	0.45
Adjusted Expected Loss Ratio (Step II)	0.495
Losses Subject to Experience Rating (Step III)	\$ 11,750
Premium Subject to Experience Rating (Step II)	\$ 39,765
Actual Loss Ratio (\$11,750/ 39,765)	0.295

Experience Modification = $\frac{0.295 - 0.495}{0.495} \times 0.45 \times 0.20 = -.036$ (factor of 0.964) or a 3.6% credit.

Physical Damage Experience Rating Plan Factors
Table C – Credibility, Adjusted Expected Loss Ratios and Maximum Single Losses

<u>Premium Level</u>	<u>Adjusted Expected Loss Ratio</u>			<u>Maximum Single Loss</u>
	<u>Credibility</u>	<u>Zone Rated</u>	<u>All Other</u>	
1 - 875	0.10	0.164	0.175	1,500
876 - 1,516	0.11	0.182	0.194	1,750
1,517 - 2,173	0.12	0.199	0.212	2,000
2,174 - 2,847	0.13	0.215	0.229	2,250
2,848 - 3,539	0.14	0.231	0.246	2,500
3,540 - 4,249	0.15	0.245	0.261	2,750
4,250 - 4,978	0.16	0.259	0.276	3,000
4,979 - 5,727	0.17	0.272	0.290	3,250
5,728 - 6,496	0.18	0.284	0.303	3,500
6,497 - 7,287	0.19	0.296	0.316	3,750
7,288 - 8,101	0.20	0.308	0.328	4,000
8,102 - 8,938	0.21	0.318	0.339	4,250
8,939 - 9,800	0.22	0.328	0.350	4,500
9,801 - 10,687	0.23	0.338	0.360	4,750
10,688 - 11,601	0.24	0.347	0.370	5,000
11,602 - 12,542	0.25	0.356	0.379	5,250
12,543 - 13,514	0.26	0.364	0.388	5,500
13,515 - 14,515	0.27	0.372	0.396	5,750
14,516 - 15,549	0.28	0.379	0.404	6,000
15,550 - 16,616	0.29	0.387	0.412	6,250
16,617 - 17,719	0.30	0.393	0.419	6,500
17,720 - 18,859	0.31	0.400	0.426	6,750
18,860 - 20,038	0.32	0.406	0.433	7,000
20,039 - 21,258	0.33	0.412	0.439	7,250
21,259 - 22,521	0.34	0.417	0.445	7,500
22,522 - 23,830	0.35	0.422	0.450	7,750
23,831 - 25,187	0.36	0.428	0.456	8,000
25,188 - 26,595	0.37	0.432	0.461	8,250
26,596 - 28,056	0.38	0.437	0.466	8,500
28,057 - 29,575	0.39	0.441	0.471	8,750

Physical Damage Experience Rating Plan Factors
Table C – Credibility, Adjusted Expected Loss Ratios and Maximum Single Losses

<u>Premium Level</u>	<u>Adjusted Expected Loss Ratio</u>			<u>Maximum Single Loss</u>
	<u>Credibility</u>	<u>Zone Rated</u>	<u>All Other</u>	
29,576 - 31,153	0.40	0.446	0.475	9,000
31,154 - 32,796	0.41	0.450	0.480	9,250
32,797 - 34,506	0.42	0.454	0.484	9,500
34,507 - 36,289	0.43	0.457	0.488	9,750
36,290 - 38,148	0.44	0.461	0.492	10,000
38,149 - 40,089	0.45	0.464	0.495	10,250
40,090 - 42,118	0.46	0.468	0.499	10,500
42,119 - 44,240	0.47	0.471	0.502	10,750
44,241 - 46,462	0.48	0.474	0.505	11,000
46,463 - 48,792	0.49	0.477	0.509	11,250
48,793 - 51,236	0.50	0.480	0.512	11,500
51,237 - 53,805	0.51	0.483	0.514	11,750
53,806 - 56,508	0.52	0.485	0.517	12,000
56,509 - 59,355	0.53	0.488	0.520	12,250
59,356 - 62,359	0.54	0.490	0.523	12,500
62,360 - 65,532	0.55	0.493	0.525	12,750
65,533 - 68,889	0.56	0.495	0.528	13,000
68,890 - 72,448	0.57	0.497	0.530	13,250
72,449 - 76,226	0.58	0.499	0.532	13,500
76,227 - 80,245	0.59	0.501	0.534	13,750
80,246 - 84,528	0.60	0.503	0.537	14,000
84,529 - 89,103	0.61	0.505	0.539	14,250
89,104 - 93,999	0.62	0.507	0.541	14,500
94,000 - 99,253	0.63	0.509	0.543	14,750
99,254 - 104,904	0.64	0.511	0.544	15,000
104,905 - 111,001	0.65	0.512	0.546	15,250
111,002 - 117,597	0.66	0.514	0.548	15,500
117,598 - 124,756	0.67	0.515	0.550	15,750
124,757 - 132,555	0.68	0.517	0.551	16,000
132,556 - 141,082	0.69	0.518	0.553	16,250

Physical Damage Experience Rating Plan Factors
Table C – Credibility, Adjusted Expected Loss Ratios and Maximum Single Losses

<u>Premium Level</u>		<u>Adjusted Expected Loss Ratio</u>			<u>Maximum Single Loss</u>
		<u>Credibility</u>	<u>Zone Rated</u>	<u>All Other</u>	
141,083 -	150,444	0.70	0.520	0.554	16,500
150,445 -	160,772	0.71	0.521	0.556	16,750
160,773 -	172,221	0.72	0.522	0.557	17,000
172,222 -	184,986	0.73	0.524	0.558	17,250
184,987 -	199,307	0.74	0.525	0.560	17,500
199,308 -	215,486	0.75	0.526	0.561	17,750
215,487 -	233,911	0.76	0.527	0.562	18,000
233,912 -	255,084	0.77	0.529	0.563	18,250
255,085 -	279,669	0.78	0.530	0.565	18,500
279,670 -	308,565	0.79	0.531	0.566	18,750
308,566 -	343,012	0.80	0.532	0.567	19,000
343,013 -	384,782	0.81	0.533	0.568	19,250
384,783 -	436,486	0.82	0.534	0.569	19,500
436,487 -	502,146	0.83	0.535	0.570	19,750
502,147 -	588,297	0.84	0.536	0.571	20,000
588,298 -	706,302	0.85	0.536	0.572	20,250
706,303 -	877,834	0.86	0.537	0.573	20,500
877,835 -	1,149,999	0.87	0.538	0.574	20,750
1,150,000 -	1,648,112	0.88	0.539	0.575	21,000
1,648,113 -	2,853,225	0.89	0.540	0.576	21,250
2,853,226 -	and Over	0.90	0.541	0.576	21,500

The application of these Supplementary Rules is mandatory for all insureds meeting the eligibility requirements as contained in Sections I and II of this Plan. Any action taken in any form to evade the application of an experience modification determined in accordance with this Plan is prohibited.

A. DEFINITIONS

1. Entity

The term entity shall mean an individual, partnership, corporation, unincorporated association or fiduciary, i.e., trustee, receiver, executor or administrator.

2. Risk

The term risk for the purpose of this Section shall mean:

- a. a single entity, or
- b. two or more entities which must be combined under the provisions of this Plan regardless of whether insurance is or has been provided by one or more policies or insurance carriers.

3. Majority Interest

Majority shall mean more than 50% ownership or other property interest.

If an entity other than a partnership

- a. has issued voting stock, majority interest shall mean a majority of the issued voting stock;
- b. has not issued voting stock, majority interest shall mean a majority of its members;
- c. has not issued voting stock and has no members, majority interest shall mean a majority of the board of directors or comparable governing body.

If an entity is a partnership, majority interest shall be determined in accordance with the participation of each general partner in the profits of the partnership.

4. Ownership Interest

- a. Ownership interest of any corporation shall be determined on the basis of the ownership of the issued voting stock of any such corporation.
- b. If there is no issued voting stock, ownership interest shall be determined on the basis of its members if the entity is other than a partnership.
- c. If there is neither issued voting stock nor members, ownership interest shall be determined on the basis of the membership of the board of directors or comparable governing body if the entity is other than a partnership.
- d. Ownership interest of any partnership shall be determined in accordance with the participation of each general partner in the profits of the partnership.
- e. Ownership interest shall be deemed to be vested in a fiduciary when a fiduciary is involved. However, fiduciary shall not include a debtor in possession, a trustee under a revocable trust or a franchisor. Ownership interest held by an entity in a fiduciary capacity and ownership interest held by the same entity in a non-fiduciary capacity shall be deemed to be ownership interest of the same entity.

B. COMBINATION OF ENTITIES

1. Two or more entities shall be combined for rating purposes if the same person, or group of persons, or corporation owns a majority interest in each such entity.
2. If an entity owns a majority interest in another entity which in turn owns the majority interest in another entity, all entities so related shall be combined regardless of the number of entities in succession.

In those instances where two or more different combinations are possible, the combination involving the greatest number of entities shall be made. The experience of any entity used in such a combination shall not otherwise be used in combination with the experience of any other entity.

C. MERGER OR CONSOLIDATION

1. Merger

If two or more entities are merged so that the ownership interest of all such entities are combined in the surviving entity, the incurred experience of all such merged entities shall be used for experience rating the surviving entity.

2. Consolidation

If two or more entities are consolidated by replacing them with a new entity combining the ownership interest of the prior entities, the incurred experience of all such consolidated entities shall be used for experience rating the new entity.

D. CHANGE OF OWNERSHIP, CONTROL, MANAGEMENT, NAME OR OPERATIONS

Due inquiry should be made into all cases of purported change of ownership raising reasonable doubt as to the validity and good faith of the transfer. The insurance carrier may require the transferee to pay a premium based upon the experience modification applicable to the transferor or the manual rate, whichever is higher, pending investigation of the facts of the case and subject to later adjustment if appropriate. A proper period for investigation of the facts shall be allowed in all cases of doubt about the validity of a purported change of ownership.

For purposes of this Plan a change in ownership includes any of the following:

- i. sale, transfer or conveyance of an entity's ownership interest,
- ii. sale, transfer or conveyance of an entity's physical assets to another entity which takes over its operations,
- iii. merger or consolidation of two or more entities,
- iv. Formation of a new entity subsequent to the dissolution or non-operative capacity of an entity, and or
- v. voluntary or court mandated establishment of a trustee or receiver, excluding a debtor in possession, a trustee under a revocable trust, or a franchisor.

1. Continuation of Experience

Unless excluded under D.iii. of this Section, the experience for any entity undergoing a change of ownership shall be transferred to the experience ratings of the acquiring, surviving or new entity.

EXCEPTION

If an entity disposes of part of its operations, but otherwise continues to operate its business, or if a multiple entity risk disposes of one or more entities whose statistical data has been combined on a single policy, the experience shall continue to be used in future experience ratings of the seller unless the rating company is furnished with the appropriate experience to provide for transfer of the data to the acquiring entity.

2. Recalculated Experience Modification Due to a Change in Ownership

a. Unless excluded under the provisions of D.iii. of this Section, the experience of an entity undergoing a change of ownership shall be retained in future ratings in accordance with the following procedure:

- (1) The experience modification of the new owner shall be revised to include the past experience of the acquired entity subject to Sections I and II under Subsection C. Experience Used.
- (2) If the new owner is not experience rated, an experience modification shall be calculated utilizing the experience of the acquired entity together with any applicable existing experience.
- (3) If based on its ownership in other entities, the previous owner continues to be experience rated after the change in ownership, its experience modification shall be revised to exclude all experience of the relinquished entity.

b. Experience modifications in accordance with D.2.a.(1), (2) and (3) of this Section shall be calculated and applied as follows:

- (1) If the first written reporting of the ownership change by either the acquiring entity or the acquired entity to their carrier occurs within 90 days of the date of the change, the calculation of the revised modification shall be as of the date of the change.
- (2) If the first written reporting of such change occurs more than 90 days after the date of the change, the calculation of the revised

modification shall be as of the next anniversary rating date following the earliest notice either carrier received of the change.

3. Exclusion of Experience

- a. In the event of a change in ownership, if after such change, the new owner is a taxi risk with two or less vehicles, the experience of the prior owner shall not be included in the calculation of future experience ratings. In the event, however, the new owner subsequently becomes a taxi risk with three or more vehicles, the experience of the prior owner shall prospectively be considered for experience rating purposes subject to the other provisions of this Section.
- b. In all other instances, the experience of any other entity undergoing a change of ownership shall be excluded from future experience rating calculations only if each of the following conditions of D.3.b.(1), (2) and (3) of this Section are met.

(1) The change must be a material change such that the:

- (a) entire ownership interest after the change had no ownership interest before the change, or
- (b) the collective ownership of all those having an interest in an entity both before the change and after the change amounts to either less than one-third ownership before the change or less than one-half ownership after the change.

(2) The material change in ownership is accompanied by a change in operations sufficient to result in reclassification of the governing classification.

(3) The material change in ownership is accompanied by a change in the process and hazard of the operations.

(4) If the experience of an entity is to be excluded, the experience modification no longer applies as of the date of the change. An experience modification of 1.00 shall apply effective the date of the change, unless acquired by an entity with an existing experience modification.

4. Self-Insured or Discontinued Operations

The experience rating of a risk shall retain all experience for any part of its operations which may have been discontinued or self-insured.

5. Notification Requirement

When an ownership change occurs the insured shall report the details of such change to its carrier. This may be done by submitting the details of the change in narrative form on the letterhead of the insured, signed by an officer of the company.

The carrier will determine the type of change and combinability of the entities involved.

APPENDIX A

Applicable to Section I Liability and Section II Physical Damage

If the actual exposures of the risk have been subject to a 25% change since the experience period, apply the following advisory procedure to determine the basic limits premium subject to experience rating. The 25% differential shall be determined by averaging the actual exposures from the experience period, and comparing the resulting average exposures to the current exposures. An example of this calculation follows:

Current Exposure = 25

Experience Period

3rd Prior Year = 35

2nd Prior Year = 35

1st Prior Year = 33

Average Exposure = 34.33

$(25 - 34.33) / 34.33 = 27.18\%$ change in exposure

Historical Exposures at Present CAR Rates Method

Procedure:

Determine the actual historical exposures on the present rating basis by classification and garaging for each policy of the experience period.

The actual exposures by classification and garaging for a given year of the experience period, when multiplied by the present basic limits CAR rates and then multiplied by the appropriate detrend factor from Table A in Section I for Liability and Section II for Physical Damage, yields the annual basic limits CAR premium for that year of the experience period.

The Servicing Carrier shall determine the applicability of this rating procedure based upon the credibility of the documentation supplied in support of the change in exposure level.

If the historical exposure information is not obtainable from the company insuring the risk during the experience period, historical information may be obtained in the form of a signed statement from the insured. Exposure information submitted in such form may be excluded from the rating if its reliability cannot be established.