CAR | Commercial Automobile Experience Rating Plan | Section I | Liability | Revision Date | 2014.09.01 | Page | 1 of 11

This Experience Rating Plan is designed and its rating parameters have been calculated using experience for basic limits Bodily Injury Liability (BI), Personal Injury Protection (PIP), and Property Damage Liability (PDL). Premises and operations liability is also included for garage risks. Therefore, the premiums and losses used in deriving the experience modification for any risk under this Plan should include data from only these coverages.

A. ELIGIBILITY

The term risk as used in this Plan means the exposures of any one insured which are to be rated. Allied or subsidiary interests shall not be included unless:

- 1. The insured holds a majority financial interest therein, or
- 2. The following conditions exist under an exclusive franchise arrangement between the franchise grantor and the other interests to be rated:
 - a. all interests operate under a common trade name, and
 - b. all interests use one or more identical products or services obtained through the franchise grantor, and
 - c. one source establishes and maintains standards regarding management control and is responsible for insurance premium payment for all interests operating under the exclusive franchise, and
 - d. there is no legal prohibition against ownership by the franchise grantor of the operations of the other interests to be rated.

Expenses other than allocated loss adjustment expenses are not taken into consideration in the parameters of this Plan.

Any risk meeting the following qualifications for the BI, PIP, and PDL exposure to be rated shall be eligible for the application of this Plan:

- (1) Five or more private passenger or commercial automobiles, one or more taxicabs, three or more public automobiles of any other type, or five or more plates of any type for risks which include registration plates not issued for a specific automobile such as garage risks, or the equivalent of such exposures for automobiles hired by the risk, or
- (2) Annual basic limits manual premium of at least \$2,500, including premises and operations premium, for garage risks not subject to the Massachusetts Compulsory Law, or for employers non-ownership

CAR Section I Liability Revision Date Page 2 of 11 Commercial Automobile Experience Rating Plan Liability 2014.09.01 2 of 11

liability exposure. Note that the headquarters location of the risk shall govern the application of this Plan for all employers non-ownership liability exposures regardless of location.

B. EXPERIENCE MODIFICATION

The experience modification for the risk shall be determined in accordance with the experience rating procedure described herein and shall be applied to the total current manual premium, including all increased limits, and premises and operations for garage risks for the BI, PIP, and PDL coverages on the policy being rated.

C. EXPERIENCE USED

The experience modification shall be determined, by the company establishing the rating, from the latest available three completed policy years of experience incurred in this state, or in all states by the risk. In the event the experience for the full experience period is not available, at least two completed policy years shall be used. Risks with less than two completed policy years of experience shall not be experience rated. The experience period shall end at least six months prior to the rating date.

Experience developed by companies other than the company establishing the modification or self-insured experience may be used subject to the periods specified above. If the risk has been self-insured or insured with a company from which the experience is not obtainable, the experience may be used if submitted to the company in the form of a statement signed by the insured. Experience in such form may be excluded from the rating if its reliability can not be established.

D. DETERMINATION OF EXPERIENCE MODIFICATION

The term basic limits shall mean \$20,000/40,000 BI, \$8,000 PIP, and \$5,000 PDL.

1. Total Basic Limits Premium Subject to Experience Rating

The premiums to be included in the rating are calculated as follows:

a. Determine the current annual basic limits premium for BI, PIP and PDL for the policy being rated using CAR's current manual rates. The policy being rated is the policy to which the experience modification of D.7. of this Section shall apply.

CAR | Commercial Automobile Experience Rating Plan | Section I | Liability | Revision Date | 2014.09.01 | Page | 3 of 11

b. The annual basic limits premium for each year of the experience period is the annual basic limits premium determined according to D.1.a. of this Section, multiplied by the appropriate detrend factor from Table A of this Section.

Liability Experience Rating Plan Factors Table A – Premium Detrend Factors

		2^{nd}	3^{rd}
	Latest Year	Latest Year	Latest Year
Taxi	0. 909	0.870	0. 833
All Other	0. 921	0. 885	0.853

- c. The total basic limits premium subject to experience rating is equal to the sum of the detrended annual basic limits premiums calculated according to D.1.b. of this Section.
- d. If exposures have changed during the experience period, refer to the supplement to determine if an alternative rating methodology is in order.

2. Basic Limits Losses Subject to Experience Rating

The losses to be included in the rating shall be the total of the following:

- a. Paid and outstanding losses, including allocated loss adjustment expense (ALAE) for each year in the experience period, with the indemnity amount limited to basic limits, and with the amount of indemnity and allocated loss adjustment expense resulting from any single occurrence limited by the maximum single loss (MSL) value specified in Table C of this Section based on the total basic limits premium subject to experience rating.
 - Property damage losses and ALAE from the experience period shall be adjusted to the deductible basis, if any, that applies for the policy being rated.
- b. Adjustment to reflect ultimate level of losses for each year in the experience period, is calculated by multiplying the annual basic limits premium from D.1.b. of this Section for the year by the adjusted expected loss ratio (AELR) and by the appropriate basic limits loss development factor (LDF). The formula for this adjustment is P x AELR x LDF, where
 - (1) P is the annual basic limits premium for the particular year in the experience period from D.1.b. of this Section.

- (2) AELR is the adjusted expected loss ratio specified in Table C of this Section based on the total basic limits premium subject to experience rating from D.1.c. of this Section. If a risk includes more than one vehicle type, then the AELR from Table C of this Section should be the AELR for the predominant class of risk on the policy.
- (3) LDF is the appropriate CAR basic limits loss development factor from Table B of this Section.

Liability Experience Rating Plan Factors Table B – Loss Development Factors

	Latest <u>Year</u>		${f L}$	2 nd Latest <u>Year</u>		3 rd Latest <u>Year</u>		Factors for Immature Years*	
Maturity (Months)	Taxi 18 0.000	All Other 18 0.015	Taxi 30 0.000	All Other 30 0.000	Taxi 42 0.000	All Other 42 0.000	Taxi 6 0.675	All Other 6 0.771	
Maturity (Months) LDF	21 0.000	21 0.007	33 0.000	33 0.000	45 0.000	45 0.000	9 0. 315	9 0.425	
Maturity (Months) LDF	24 0.000	24 0.000	36 0.000	36 0.000	48 0.000	48 0.000	12 0. 011	12 0.118	
Maturity (Months) LDF	27 0.000	27 0.000	39 0.000	39 0.000	51 0.000	51 0.000	15 0.000	15 0.023	

* In cases where an insured has changed carriers, the company establishing the rating may be unable to obtain current valuations of past losses from previous carriers. Therefore losses may be evaluated at less than 18 months.

The maturity of the losses for any year in the experience period is defined as the number of months between the latest loss valuation and the effective date of the policy to which these losses are assignable.

3. Actual Loss Ratio

Determine the actual loss ratio (ALR) by dividing the basic limits losses subject to experience rating from D.2.a. and D.2.b. of this Section by the

CAR | Commercial Automobile Experience Rating Plan | Section I | Liability | 2014.09.01 | Page | 5 of 11

total basic limits premium subject to experience rating from D.1.c. of this Section.

4. Credibility

The credibility for the risk is obtained from Table C of this Section, based on the total basic limits premium subject to experience rating.

5. Adjusted Expected Loss Ratio

The AELR for the risk is obtained from Table C of this Section based on the total basic limits premium subject to experience rating. If a risk includes more than one vehicle type, then the AELR from Table C of this Section should be the AELR for the predominant class of risk on the policy.

6. Experience Rating Adjustment Factor

The Experience Rating Adjustment Factor (ERAF) is a component applied to each calculation of the experience modification. The factor is 0.80.

7. Experience Modification

If the experience modification is negative, it is a credit; if positive, it is a debit.

CAR Section I Liability Revision Date Page 6 of 11 Commercial Automobile Experience Rating Plan Liability Automobile Experience Rating Plan Commercial Automobile Experience Rating Plan Liability Commercial Automobile Experience Rating Plan Liability

LIABILITY EXPERIENCE RATING PLAN EXAMPLE

I. Basic Information

Assume the policy to be rated is effective 09/01/14 - 08/31/15 for private passenger type vehicles.

Assume the basic limits premium for BI, PIP, and PDL using CAR rates effective 09/01/14 is \$6,000.

Assume the losses and ALAE for three years, evaluated as of 09/01/14, are as follows:

<u>Year</u> (1)	Maturity As of 09/01/14 (2)	Total Limits Losses (3)	Basic Limits Losses (4)	<u>ALAE</u> (5)	Basic Limits Losses & ALAE (4) + (5) (6)
03/01/11 - 02/29/12	42	\$ 1,500 500 100,000	\$ 1,500 500 20,000	\$ 500 100 20,000	\$ 2,000 600 40,000
03/01/12 - 02/28/13	30	750 250	750 250	100 50	850 300
03/01/13 - 02/28/14	18	250 500 250	250 500 250	50 700 75	300 1,200 325

CAR Section I Liability Revision Date Page 7 of 11 Commercial Automobile Experience Rating Plan Liability 7 of 11

II. <u>Total Basic Limits Premium Subject to Experience Rating</u> (See D.1. of this Section)

<u>Year</u> (1)	Annual Basic Limits Premium (2)	Table A <u>Detrend Factors</u> (3)	Basic Limits Premium Subject to Experience Rating (4)
3 rd Latest Year	\$6,000	0. 853	\$ 5,118
2 nd Latest Year	6,000	0. 885	5,310
Latest Year	6,000	0. 921	<u>5,526</u>
			\$ 15.954

From Table C of this Section, given the total basic limits premium subject to experience rating of \$15,954, the credibility is 0.20, the AELR is 0.408, and the MSL is \$8,000. (See D.1., 2. and 3. of this Section)

III. Basic Limits Losses Subject to Experience Rating

A. Paid and Outstanding Losses & ALAE (See D.2. of this Section)

<u>Year</u> (1)	Basic Limits Losses & ALAE (2)	Basic Limits Losses & ALAE Subject to MSL of \$8,000 (3)
03/01/11 - 02/29/12	\$ 2,000 600 40,000	\$ 2,000 600 8,000
03/01/12 - 02/28/13	850 300	850 300
03/01/13 - 02/28/14	300 1,200 325	300 1,200 <u>325</u> \$13,575

CAR Section I Liability Revision Date Page 8 of 11 Commercial Automobile Experience Rating Plan Liability 8 of 11

B. Adjustment to Reflect the Ultimate Level of Losses (See D.2. of this Section)

<u>Year</u> (1)	Maturity As of 09/01/14 (2)	Premium Subject To Experience Rating (Step II) (3)	AELR (Step II) (4)	Table B LDF (5)	Adjustment to Reflect Ultimate Level of Losses (3) x (4) x (5) (6)
03/01/11 - 02/29/12	42	\$ 5,118	0.408	0.000	\$ 0
03/01/12 - 02/28/13	30	5,310	0. 408	0.000	0
03/01/13 - 02/28/14	18	<u>5,526</u>	0. 408	0. 015	_34
		\$ 15,954			\$ 34

IV. Experience Modification

Credibility (Step II)	0.20
Adjusted Expected Loss Ratio (Step II)	0.408
Basic Limits Losses Subject to Experience Rating	
(\$13,575 + \$34) (Step III)	\$ 13,609
Basic Limits Premium (Step II)	\$ 15,954
Actual Loss Ratio (\$13,609 / \$15,954)	0.853

Experience Modification = $\frac{0.853 - 0.408}{0.408}$ x 0.20 x 0.80 = 0.175 (factor of 1.175) or a 17.5% debit

CAR | Commercial Automobile Experience Rating Plan | Section I | Liability | 2014.09.01 | Page | 9 of 11

Liability Experience Rating Plan Factors

Table C – Credibility, Adjusted Expect Loss Ratios and Maximum Single Losses

			Adjuste	d Expected 1	Loss Ratio	Maximum
Premium	<u>Levels</u>	Credibility	Taxicabs	Zone Rated	All Other	Single Losses
1 -	1,751	0.10	0.257	0.248	0.250	3,000
1,752 -	3,033	0.11	0.283	0.273	0.275	3,500
3,034 -	4,347	0.12	0.307	0.295	0.298	4,000
4,348 -	5,695	0.13	0.328	0.316	0.318	4,500
5,696 -	7,078	0.14	0.348	0.335	0.337	5,000
7,079 -	8,498	0.15	0.365	0.351	0.354	5,500
8,499 -	9,956	0.16	0.378	0.364	0.367	6,000
9,957 -	11,454	0.17	0.389	0.375	0.378	6,500
11,455 -	12,993	0.18	0.400	0.385	0.388	7,000
12,994 -	14,576	0.19	0.410	0.395	0.398	7,500
1 1 555	1 < 202	0.20	0.420	0.404	0.400	0.000
14,577 -	16,203	0.20	0.420	0.404	0.408	8,000
16,204 -	17,877	0.21	0.429	0.413	0.416	8,500
17,878 -	19,600	0.22	0.438	0.422	0.425	9,000
19,601 -	21,375	0.23	0.446	0.430	0.433	9,500
21,376 -	23,202	0.24	0.455	0.438	0.441	10,000
22 202	25.006	0.25	0.462	0.446	0.440	10.500
23,203 -	25,086	0.25	0.463	0.446	0.449	10,500
25,087 -	27,028	0.26	0.471	0.453	0.457	11,000
27,029 -	29,031	0.27	0.478	0.460	0.464	11,500
29,032 -	31,099	0.28	0.485	0.467	0.471	12,000
31,100 -	33,234	0.29	0.492	0.474	0.478	12,500
33,235 -	35,439	0.30	0.499	0.481	0.485	13,000
35,440 -	37,719	0.30	0.499	0.487	0.491	13,500
37,720 -	,	0.31	0.500	0.487	0.491	14,000
,	40,077					,
40,078 -	42,517	0.33	0.519	0.499	0.503	14,500
42,518 -	45,043	0.34	0.525	0.505	0.509	15,000
45,044 -	47,661	0.35	0.530	0.511	0.515	15,500
47,662 -	50,375	0.36	0.536	0.516	0.520	16,000
50,376 -	53,190	0.37	0.542	0.521	0.526	16,500
53,191 -	56,113	0.38	0.547	0.521	0.520	17,000
56,114 -	59,150	0.39	0.552	0.520	0.535	17,500
50,114 -	37,130	0.39	0.332	0.551	0.555	17,500

CAR Section I Liability
Revision Date Page 10 of 11

Commercial Automobile Experience Rating Plan
Liability

10 of 11

Liability Experience Rating Plan Factors

Table C – Credibility, Adjusted Expect Loss Ratios and Maximum Single Losses

			Adjuste	d Expected	Loss Ratio	Maximum
<u>Premiun</u>	n Levels	Credibility	Taxicabs	Zone Rated	All Other	Single Losses
70.171		0.40	^	0.701	0.740	10.000
59,151 -	62,307	0.40	0.557	0.536	0.540	18,000
62,308 -	65,592	0.41	0.561	0.541	0.545	18,500
65,593 -	69,013	0.42	0.566	0.545	0.549	19,000
69,014 -	72,578	0.43	0.571	0.549	0.554	19,500
72,579 -	76,297	0.44	0.575	0.553	0.558	20,000
76,298 -	80,179	0.45	0.579	0.557	0.562	20,500
80,180 -	84,236	0.46	0.583	0.561	0.566	21,000
84,237 -	88,481	0.47	0.587	0.565	0.570	21,500
88,482 -	92,925	0.48	0.591	0.569	0.573	22,000
92,926 -	97,584	0.49	0.595	0.572	0.577	22,500
92,920 -	71,30 4	0.49	0.333	0.372	0.377	22,300
97,585 -	102,474	0.50	0.598	0.576	0.580	23,000
102,475 -	107,611	0.51	0.601	0.579	0.584	23,500
107,612 -	113,017	0.52	0.605	0.582	0.587	24,000
113,018 -	118,711	0.53	0.608	0.585	0.590	24,500
118,712 -	124,718	0.54	0.611	0.588	0.593	25,000
124,719 -	131,064	0.55	0.614	0.591	0.596	25,500
131,065 -	137,780	0.56	0.616	0.593	0.598	26,000
137,781 -	144,897	0.57	0.619	0.596	0.601	26,500
144,898 -	152,453	0.58	0.621	0.598	0.603	27,000
152,454 -	160,491	0.59	0.624	0.600	0.605	27,500
160,492 -	169,057	0.60	0.626	0.603	0.607	28,000
169,058 -	178,206	0.61	0.628	0.605	0.609	28,500
178,207 -	187,999	0.62	0.630	0.606	0.611	29,000
188,000 -	198,506	0.63	0.632	0.608	0.613	29,500
,	*	0.63	0.634	0.610	0.615	30,000
198,507 -	209,810	0.04	0.034	0.010	0.013	30,000
209,811 -	222,003	0.65	0.635	0.612	0.617	30,500
222,004 -	235,195	0.66	0.637	0.613	0.618	31,000
235,196 -	249,514	0.67	0.639	0.615	0.620	31,500
249,515 -	265,111	0.68	0.640	0.616	0.621	32,000
265,112 -	282,165	0.69	0.641	0.618	0.623	32,500

CAR | Commercial Automobile Experience Rating Plan | Section I | Liability | 2014.09.01 | Page | 11 of 11

Liability Experience Rating Plan Factors

Table C – Credibility, Adjusted Expect Loss Ratios and Maximum Single Losses

			Adjuste	Adjusted Expected Loss Ratio			
<u>Premiu</u>	m Levels	Credibility	Taxicabs	Zone Rated	l All Other	Single Losses	
282,166 -	300,890	0.70	0.643	0.619	0.624	33,000	
300,891 -	321,545	0.71	0.644	0.620	0.625	33,500	
321,546 -	344,443	0.72	0.645	0.621	0.626	34,000	
344,444 -	369,973	0.73	0.647	0.623	0.628	34,500	
369,974 -	398,614	0.74	0.648	0.624	0.629	35,000	
200 615	420.072	0.75	0.649	0.625	0.620	25 500	
398,615 -	430,972			0.625	0.630	35,500	
430,973 -	467,822	0.76	0.650	0.626	0.631	36,000	
467,823 -	510,168	0.77	0.651	0.627	0.632	36,500	
510,169 -	559,340	0.78	0.652	0.628	0.633	37,000	
559,341 -	617,130	0.79	0.653	0.629	0.634	37,500	
617,131 -	686,025	0.80	0.654	0.630	0.635	38,000	
686,026 -	769,564	0.81	0.655	0.631	0.636	38,500	
769,565 -	872,972	0.82	0.656	0.632	0.637	39,000	
872,973 -	1,004,293	0.83	0.657	0.632	0.638	39,500	
1,004,294 -	1,176,595	0.84	0.658	0.633	0.638	40,000	
1 176 506	1 412 604	0.05	0.659	0.634	0.639	40.500	
1,176,596 -	1,412,604	0.85				40,500	
1,412,605 -	1,755,669	0.86	0.659	0.635	0.640	41,000	
1,755,670 -	2,299,999	0.87	0.660	0.636	0.641	41,500	
2,300,000 -	3,296,225	0.88	0.661	0.636	0.641	42,000	
3,296,226 -	5,706,451	0.89	0.662	0.637	0.642	42,500	
5,706,452 -	and Over	0.90	0.662	0.638	0.643	43,000	