CARCommercial Automobile Experience Rating PlanSection ILiabilityRevision Date2013.04.01Page1 of 11

This Experience Rating Plan is designed and its rating parameters have been calculated using experience for basic limits Bodily Injury Liability (BI), Personal Injury Protection (PIP), and Property Damage Liability (PDL). Premises and operations liability is also included for garage risks. Therefore, the premiums and losses used in deriving the experience modification for any risk under this Plan should include data from only these coverages.

A. ELIGIBILITY

The term risk as used in this Plan means the exposures of any one insured which are to be rated. Allied or subsidiary interests shall not be included unless:

- 1. The insured holds a majority financial interest therein, or
- 2. The following conditions exist under an exclusive franchise arrangement between the franchise grantor and the other interests to be rated:
 - a. all interests operate under a common trade name, and
 - b. all interests use one or more identical products or services obtained through the franchise grantor, and
 - c. one source establishes and maintains standards regarding management control and is responsible for insurance premium payment for all interests operating under the exclusive franchise, and
 - d. there is no legal prohibition against ownership by the franchise grantor of the operations of the other interests to be rated.

Expenses other than allocated loss adjustment expenses are not taken into consideration in the parameters of this Plan.

Any risk meeting the following qualifications for the BI, PIP, and PDL exposure to be rated shall be eligible for the application of this Plan:

- (1) Five or more private passenger or commercial automobiles, one or more taxicabs, three or more public automobiles of any other type, or five or more plates of any type for risks which include registration plates not issued for a specific automobile such as garage risks, or the equivalent of such exposures for automobiles hired by the risk, or
- (2) Annual basic limits manual premium of at least \$2,500, including premises and operations premium, for garage risks not subject to the Massachusetts Compulsory Law, or for employers non-ownership

CARCommercial Automobile Experience Rating PlanSection ILiabilityRevision Date2013.04.01Page2 of 11

liability exposure. Note that the headquarters location of the risk shall govern the application of this Plan for all employers non-ownership liability exposures regardless of location.

B. EXPERIENCE MODIFICATION

The experience modification for the risk shall be determined in accordance with the experience rating procedure described herein and shall be applied to the total current manual premium, including all increased limits, and premises and operations for garage risks for the BI, PIP, and PDL coverages on the policy being rated.

C. EXPERIENCE USED

The experience modification shall be determined, by the company establishing the rating, from the latest available three completed policy years of experience incurred in this state, or in all states by the risk. In the event the experience for the full experience period is not available, at least two completed policy years shall be used. Risks with less than two completed policy years of experience shall not be experience rated. The experience period shall end at least six months prior to the rating date.

Experience developed by companies other than the company establishing the modification or self-insured experience may be used subject to the periods specified above. If the risk has been self-insured or insured with a company from which the experience is not obtainable, the experience may be used if submitted to the company in the form of a statement signed by the insured. Experience in such form may be excluded from the rating if its reliability can not be established.

D. DETERMINATION OF EXPERIENCE MODIFICATION

The term basic limits shall mean \$20,000/40,000 BI, \$8,000 PIP, and \$5,000 PDL.

1. Total Basic Limits Premium Subject to Experience Rating

The premiums to be included in the rating are calculated as follows:

a. Determine the current annual basic limits premium for BI, PIP and PDL for the policy being rated using CAR's current manual rates. The policy being rated is the policy to which the experience modification of D.6. of this Section shall apply.

CARCommercial Automobile Experience Rating PlanSection ILiabilityRevision Date2013.04.01Page3 of 11

b. The annual basic limits premium for each year of the experience period is the annual basic limits premium determined according to D.1.a. of this Section, multiplied by the appropriate detrend factor from Table A of this Section.

Liability Experience Rating Plan Factors Table A – Premium Detrend Factors

| | | 2^{nd} | 3 rd |
|-----------|-------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| | Latest Year | <u>Latest Year</u> | <u>Latest Year</u> |
| Taxi | 0.938 | 0.910 | 0.883 |
| All Other | 0.913 | 0.874 | 0.840 |

- c. The total basic limits premium subject to experience rating is equal to the sum of the detrended annual basic limits premiums calculated according to D.1.b. of this Section.
- d. If exposures have changed during the experience period, refer to the supplement to determine if an alternative rating methodology is in order.
- 2. Basic Limits Losses Subject to Experience Rating

The losses to be included in the rating shall be the total of the following:

a. Paid and outstanding losses, including allocated loss adjustment expense (ALAE) for each year in the experience period, with the indemnity amount limited to basic limits, and with the amount of indemnity and allocated loss adjustment expense resulting from any single occurrence limited by the maximum single loss (MSL) value specified in Table C of this Section based on the total basic limits premium subject to experience rating.

Property damage losses and ALAE from the experience period shall be adjusted to the deductible basis, if any, that applies for the policy being rated.

- b. Adjustment to reflect ultimate level of losses for each year in the experience period, is calculated by multiplying the annual basic limits premium from D.1.b. of this Section for the year by the adjusted expected loss ratio (AELR) and by the appropriate basic limits loss development factor (LDF). The formula for this adjustment is P x AELR x LDF, where
 - (1) P is the annual basic limits premium for the particular year in the experience period from D.1.b. of this Section.

CARCommercial Automobile Experience Rating PlanSection ILiability

Revision Date 2013.04.01

- Page 4 of 11
 - (2) AELR is the adjusted expected loss ratio specified in Table C of this Section based on the total basic limits premium subject to experience rating from D.1.c. of this Section. If a risk includes more than one vehicle type, then the AELR from Table C of this Section should be the AELR for the predominant class of risk on the policy.
 - (3) LDF is the appropriate CAR basic limits loss development factor from Table B of this Section.

| | Latest <u>Year</u> | | L | 2 nd Latest <u>Year</u> | | 3 rd Latest <u>Year</u> | | ors for ature <u>s*</u> |
|-------------------|-----------------------|-------|-------|--|-------|--|-------|-------------------------------|
| | Taxi | All | Taxi | All | Taxi | All | Taxi | All |
| | | Other | | Other | | Other | | Other |
| Maturity (Months) | 18 | 18 | 30 | 30 | 42 | 42 | 6 | 6 |
| LDF | 0.000 | 0.014 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.667 | 0.769 |
| Maturity (Months) | 21 | 21 | 33 | 33 | 45 | 45 | 9 | 9 |
| LDF | 0.000 | 0.005 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.297 | 0.423 |
| Maturity (Months) | 24 | 24 | 36 | 36 | 48 | 48 | 12 | 12 |
| LDF | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.114 |
| Maturity (Months) | 27 | 27 | 39 | 39 | 51 | 51 | 15 | 15 |
| LDF | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.022 |

Liability Experience Rating Plan Factors Table B – Loss Development Factors

* In cases where an insured has changed carriers, the company establishing the rating may be unable to obtain current valuations of past losses from previous carriers. Therefore losses may be evaluated at less than 18 months.

The maturity of the losses for any year in the experience period is defined as the number of months between the latest loss valuation and the effective date of the policy to which these losses are assignable.

3. Actual Loss Ratio

Determine the actual loss ratio (ALR) by dividing the basic limits losses subject to experience rating from D.2.a. + D.2.b.of this Section by the total basic limits premium subject to experience rating from D.1.c. of this Section.

CARCommercial Automobile Experience Rating PlanSection ILiabilityRevision Date2013.04.01Page5 of 11

4. Credibility

The credibility for the risk is obtained from Table C of this Section, based on the total basic limits premium subject to experience rating.

5. Adjusted Expected Loss Ratio

The AELR for the risk is obtained from Table C of this Section based on the total basic limits premium subject to experience rating. If a risk includes more than one vehicle type, then the AELR from Table C of this Section should be the AELR for the predominant class of risk on the policy.

6. Experience Modification

<u>ALR - AELR</u> x CREDIBILITY = EXPERIENCE AELR MODIFICATION

If the experience modification is negative, it is a credit; if positive, it is a debit.

CARCommercial Automobile Experience Rating PlanSection ILiabilityRevision Date2013.04.01Page6 of 11

LIABILITY EXPERIENCE RATING PLAN EXAMPLE

I. Basic Information

Assume the policy to be rated is effective 04/01/13 - 03/31/14 for private passenger type vehicles.

Assume the basic limits premium for BI, PIP, and PDL using CAR rates effective 04/01/13 is \$6,000.

Assume the losses and ALAE for three years, evaluated as of 04/01/13, are as follows:

| <u>Year</u> (1) | Maturity As of <u>04/01/13</u> (2) | Total Limits Losses (3) | Basic Limits Losses (4) | <u>ALAE</u> (5) | Basic Limits Losses & ALAE (4) + (5) (6) |
|---------------------|---|----------------------------------|----------------------------------|-------------------------|--|
| 10/01/09 - 09/30/10 | 42 | \$ 1,500 500 100,000 | \$ 1,500 500 20,000 | \$ 500 100 20,000 | \$ 2,000 600 40,000 |
| 10/01/10 - 09/30/11 | 30 | 750 250 | 750 250 | 100 50 | 850 300 |
| 10/01/11 - 09/30/12 | 18 | 250 500 250 | 250 500 250 | 50 700 75 | 300 1,200 325 |

CARCommercial Automobile Experience Rating PlanSection ILiabilityRevision Date2013.04.01Page7 of 11

II. <u>**Total Basic Limits Premium Subject to Experience Rating**</u> (See D.1. of this Section)

| | | | Basic Limits Premium |
|-----------------------------|-----------------------|------------------------|-----------------------------|
| | Annual Basic | Table A | Subject to |
| <u>Year</u> | <u>Limits Premium</u> | Detrend Factors | Experience Rating |
| (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) |
| 3 rd Latest Year | \$6,000 | 0.840 | \$ 5,040 |
| 2 nd Latest Year | 6,000 | 0.874 | 5,244 |
| Latest Year | 6,000 | 0.913 | 5,478 |
| | | | \$15,762 |

From Table C of this Section, given the total basic limits premium subject to experience rating of \$15,762, the credibility is 0.20, the AELR is 0.409, and the MSL is \$8,000. (See D.1., 2. and 3. of this Section)

III. Basic Limits Losses Subject to Experience Rating

A. Paid and Outstanding Losses & ALAE (See D.2. of this Section)

| <u>Year</u> (1) | Basic Limits Losses & ALAE (2) | Basic Limits Losses & ALAE Subject to MSL <u>of \$8,000</u> (3) |
|---------------------|--------------------------------------|---|
| 10/01/09 - 09/30/10 | \$ 2,000 600 40,000 | \$ 2,000 600 8,000 |
| 10/01/10 - 09/30/11 | 850 300 | 850 300 |
| 10/01/11 - 09/30/12 | 300 1,200 325 | 300 1,200 <u>325</u> \$13,575 |

CARCommercial Automobile Experience Rating PlanSection ILiabilityRevision Date2013.04.01Page8 of 11

B. Adjustment to Reflect the Ultimate Level of Losses (See D.2. of this Section)

| <u>Year</u> (1) | Maturity As of <u>04/01/09</u> (2) | Premium Subject To Experience Rating (Step II) (3) | AELR (Step II) (4) | Table B <u>LDF</u> (5) | Adjustment to Reflect Ultimate Level of Losses (3) x (4) x (5) (6) |
|---|---|--|---------------------------------|------------------------------|--|
| 10/01/09 – 09/30/10 10/01/10 – 09/30/11 10/01/11 – 09/30/12 | 42 30 18 | \$ 5,040 5,244 <u>5,478</u> \$15,762 | 0.409 0.409 0.409 | 0.000 0.000 0.014 | |

IV. Experience Modification

| Credibility (Step II) | 0.200 |
|--|----------|
| Adjusted Expected Loss Ratio (Step II) | 0.409 |
| Basic Limits Losses Subject to Experience Rating | |
| (\$13,575 + \$31) (Step III) | \$13,606 |
| Basic Limits Premium (Step II) | \$15,762 |
| Actual Loss Ratio (\$13,606 / \$15,762) | 0.863 |

Experience Modification = $\frac{0.863 - 0.409}{0.409} \times 0.20 = 0.222$ (factor of 1.222) or a 22.2% debit 0.409

CARCommercial Automobile Experience Rating PlanSection ILiabilityRevision Date2013.04.01Page9 of 11

Liability Experience Rating Plan Factors

Table C – Credibility, Adjusted Expect Loss Ratios and Maximum Single Losses

| Premiun | <u>Premium Levels</u> <u>Credibility</u> | | Adjusted Expected Loss Ratio <u>Taxicabs</u> <u>Zone Rated</u> <u>All Other</u> | | | Maximum <u>Single Losses</u> |
|--------------------|--|------|---|------------------|-------|---------------------------------|
| 1 | 1 751 | 0.10 | 0.220 | 0.252 | 0.254 | 2 000 |
| 1 - 1,752 - | 1,751 3,033 | 0.10 | 0.239 0.262 | $0.252 \\ 0.277$ | 0.234 | 3,000 3,500 |
| 1,732 - 3,034 - | 3,033 4,347 | 0.11 | 0.282 | 0.277 | 0.279 | 4,000 |
| 3,034 - 4,348 - | 4,347 | 0.12 | 0.285 | 0.298 | 0.301 | 4,000 |
| 4,348 - 5,696 - | 7,078 | 0.13 | 0.302 | 0.318 | 0.321 | 4,300 5,000 |
| 5,090 - | 7,078 | 0.14 | 0.319 | 0.337 | 0.340 | 5,000 |
| 7,079 - | 8,498 | 0.15 | 0.334 | 0.352 | 0.355 | 5,500 |
| 8,499 - | 9,956 | 0.16 | 0.345 | 0.364 | 0.367 | 6,000 |
| 9,957 - | 11,454 | 0.17 | 0.356 | 0.375 | 0.379 | 6,500 |
| 11,455 - | 12,993 | 0.18 | 0.366 | 0.386 | 0.390 | 7,000 |
| 12,994 - | 14,576 | 0.19 | 0.376 | 0.396 | 0.400 | 7,500 |
| | | | | | | |
| 14,577 - | 16,203 | 0.20 | 0.384 | 0.405 | 0.409 | 8,000 |
| 16,204 - | 17,877 | 0.21 | 0.392 | 0.414 | 0.417 | 8,500 |
| 17,878 - | 19,600 | 0.22 | 0.400 | 0.422 | 0.426 | 9,000 |
| 19,601 - | 21,375 | 0.23 | 0.408 | 0.43 | 0.434 | 9,500 |
| 21,376 - | 23,202 | 0.24 | 0.415 | 0.438 | 0.442 | 10,000 |
| | | | | | | |
| 23,203 - | 25,086 | 0.25 | 0.423 | 0.446 | 0.450 | 10,500 |
| 25,087 - | 27,028 | 0.26 | 0.430 | 0.453 | 0.457 | 11,000 |
| 27,029 - | 29,031 | 0.27 | 0.437 | 0.46 | 0.465 | 11,500 |
| 29,032 - | 31,099 | 0.28 | 0.443 | 0.467 | 0.472 | 12,000 |
| 31,100 - | 33,234 | 0.29 | 0.450 | 0.474 | 0.478 | 12,500 |
| | | | | | | |
| 33,235 - | 35,439 | 0.30 | 0.456 | 0.480 | 0.485 | 13,000 |
| 35,440 - | 37,719 | 0.31 | 0.462 | 0.487 | 0.491 | 13,500 |
| 37,720 - | 40,077 | 0.32 | 0.467 | 0.493 | 0.497 | 14,000 |
| 40,078 - | 42,517 | 0.33 | 0.473 | 0.499 | 0.503 | 14,500 |
| 42,518 - | 45,043 | 0.34 | 0.478 | 0.504 | 0.509 | 15,000 |
| 45.044 | 17 ((1 | 0.25 | 0.404 | 0 510 | 0 515 | 15 500 |
| 45,044 - | 47,661 | 0.35 | 0.484 | 0.510 | 0.515 | 15,500 |
| 47,662 - | 50,375 | 0.36 | 0.489 | 0.515 | 0.520 | 16,000 |
| 50,376 - | 53,190 | 0.37 | 0.494 | 0.520 | 0.525 | 16,500 |
| 53,191 - | 56,113 | 0.38 | 0.498 | 0.525 | 0.530 | 17,000 |
| 56,114 - | 59,150 | 0.39 | 0.503 | 0.530 | 0.535 | 17,500 |

CARCommercial Automobile Experience Rating PlanSection ILiabilityRevision Date2013.04.01Page10 of 11

Liability Experience Rating Plan Factors

Table C – Credibility, Adjusted Expect Loss Ratios and Maximum Single Losses

| <u>Premium Levels</u> <u>Cree</u> | | <u>Credibility</u> | • | Loss Ratio <u>I All Other</u> | Maximum <u>Single Losses</u> | |
|-----------------------------------|---------|--------------------|-------|----------------------------------|---------------------------------|--------|
| 59,151 - | 62,307 | 0.40 | 0.507 | 0.535 | 0.540 | 18,000 |
| 62,308 - | 65,592 | 0.41 | 0.512 | 0.539 | 0.544 | 18,500 |
| 65,593 - | 69,013 | 0.42 | 0.516 | 0.544 | 0.549 | 19,000 |
| 69,014 - | 72,578 | 0.43 | 0.520 | 0.548 | 0.553 | 19,500 |
| 72,579 - | 76,297 | 0.44 | 0.524 | 0.552 | 0.557 | 20,000 |
| 76,298 - | 80,179 | 0.45 | 0.527 | 0.556 | 0.561 | 20,500 |
| 80,180 - | 84,236 | 0.46 | 0.531 | 0.560 | 0.565 | 21,000 |
| 84,237 - | 88,481 | 0.47 | 0.535 | 0.564 | 0.569 | 21,500 |
| 88,482 - | 92,925 | 0.48 | 0.538 | 0.567 | 0.572 | 22,000 |
| 92,926 - | 97,584 | 0.49 | 0.541 | 0.571 | 0.576 | 22,500 |
| 97,585 - | 102,474 | 0.50 | 0.544 | 0.574 | 0.579 | 23,000 |
| 102,475 - | 107,611 | 0.51 | 0.547 | 0.577 | 0.583 | 23,500 |
| 107,612 - | 113,017 | 0.52 | 0.550 | 0.580 | 0.586 | 24,000 |
| 113,018 - | 118,711 | 0.53 | 0.553 | 0.583 | 0.589 | 24,500 |
| 118,712 - | 124,718 | 0.54 | 0.556 | 0.586 | 0.591 | 25,000 |
| 124,719 - | 131,064 | 0.55 | 0.558 | 0.589 | 0.594 | 25,500 |
| 131,065 - | 137,780 | 0.56 | 0.561 | 0.591 | 0.597 | 26,000 |
| 137,781 - | 144,897 | 0.57 | 0.563 | 0.594 | 0.599 | 26,500 |
| 144,898 - | 152,453 | 0.58 | 0.565 | 0.596 | 0.601 | 27,000 |
| 152,454 - | 160,491 | 0.59 | 0.567 | 0.598 | 0.604 | 27,500 |
| 160,492 - | 169,057 | 0.60 | 0.569 | 0.600 | 0.606 | 28,000 |
| 169,058 - | 178,206 | 0.61 | 0.571 | 0.602 | 0.608 | 28,500 |
| 178,207 - | 187,999 | 0.62 | 0.573 | 0.604 | 0.610 | 29,000 |
| 188,000 - | 198,506 | 0.63 | 0.575 | 0.606 | 0.611 | 29,500 |
| 198,507 - | 209,810 | 0.64 | 0.576 | 0.608 | 0.613 | 30,000 |
| 209,811 - | 222,003 | 0.65 | 0.578 | 0.609 | 0.615 | 30,500 |
| 222,004 - | 235,195 | 0.66 | 0.579 | 0.611 | 0.617 | 31,000 |
| 235,196 - | 249,514 | 0.67 | 0.581 | 0.612 | 0.618 | 31,500 |
| 249,515 - | 265,111 | 0.68 | 0.582 | 0.614 | 0.619 | 32,000 |
| 265,112 - | 282,165 | 0.69 | 0.584 | 0.615 | 0.621 | 32,500 |

CARCommercial Automobile Experience Rating PlanSection ILiabilityRevision Date2013.04.01Page11 of 11

Liability Experience Rating Plan Factors

Table C – Credibility, Adjusted Expect Loss Ratios and Maximum Single Losses

| D | | C | • | Adjusted Expected Loss Ratio Taxicabs Zone Rated All Other | | | |
|---------------|------------------|--------------------|------------------|---|------------------|---------------|--|
| <u>Premiu</u> | <u>ım Levels</u> | <u>Credibility</u> | <u>1 axicabs</u> | Zone Rated | <u>All Other</u> | Single Losses | |
| 282,166 - | 300,890 | 0.70 | 0.585 | 0.617 | 0.622 | 33,000 | |
| 300,891 - | 321,545 | 0.71 | 0.586 | 0.618 | 0.624 | 33,500 | |
| 321,546 - | 344,443 | 0.72 | 0.587 | 0.619 | 0.625 | 34,000 | |
| 344,444 - | 369,973 | 0.73 | 0.588 | 0.620 | 0.626 | 34,500 | |
| 369,974 - | 398,614 | 0.74 | 0.590 | 0.621 | 0.627 | 35,000 | |
| 398,615 - | 430,972 | 0.75 | 0.591 | 0.623 | 0.628 | 35,500 | |
| 430,973 - | 467,822 | 0.76 | 0.592 | 0.624 | 0.629 | 36,000 | |
| 467,823 - | 510,168 | 0.77 | 0.593 | 0.625 | 0.631 | 36,500 | |
| 510,169 - | 559,340 | 0.78 | 0.594 | 0.626 | 0.632 | 37,000 | |
| 559,341 - | 617,130 | 0.79 | 0.594 | 0.627 | 0.633 | 37,500 | |
| 617,131 - | 686,025 | 0.80 | 0.595 | 0.628 | 0.633 | 38,000 | |
| 686,026 - | 769,564 | 0.80 | 0.595 | 0.628 | 0.634 | 38,500 | |
| 769,565 - | 872,972 | 0.81 | 0.590 | 0.628 | 0.635 | 39,000 | |
| 872,973 - | 1,004,293 | 0.82 | 0.598 | 0.620 | 0.636 | 39,500 | |
| 1,004,294 - | 1,176,595 | 0.83 | 0.599 | 0.631 | 0.637 | 40,000 | |
| | | | | | | | |
| 1,176,596 - | 1,412,604 | 0.85 | 0.599 | 0.632 | 0.638 | 40,500 | |
| 1,412,605 - | 1,755,669 | 0.86 | 0.600 | 0.632 | 0.638 | 41,000 | |
| 1,755,670 - | 2,299,999 | 0.87 | 0.601 | 0.633 | 0.639 | 41,500 | |
| 2,300,000 - | 3,296,225 | 0.88 | 0.601 | 0.634 | 0.640 | 42,000 | |
| 3,296,226 - | 5,706,451 | 0.89 | 0.602 | 0.634 | 0.640 | 42,500 | |
| 5,706,452 - | and Over | 0.90 | 0.602 | 0.635 | 0.641 | 43,000 | |