



NATALIE A. HUBLEY  
PRESIDENT

COMMONWEALTH AUTOMOBILE REINSURERS

101 Arch Street, Suite 400 Boston, Massachusetts 02110  
www.commauto.com 617-338-4000

## RECORDS OF MEETING

### LOSS RESERVING COMMITTEE – MARCH 9, 2018

#### Members Present

Ms. Lynellen Ramirez – Chair	Arbella Insurance Group
Ms. Alyssa Potter	The Hanover Insurance Company
Ms. Melissa Vaughn <sup>(1)</sup>	Safety Insurance Company

Substituted for:

<sup>(1)</sup> Mr. Glenn Hiltbold

Not in Attendance:

Mr. Warren Ehrlich, MAPFRE U.S.A. Corporation

The Committee agreed to a waiver of the 10-day meeting notice.

#### 17.01 Records of Previous Meeting

The Committee unanimously voted to approve the Records of the Loss Reserving Committee meeting of December 6, 2017. The Records have been distributed and are on file.

#### 18.04 Quality of Current Quarter Reporting

Mr. Timothy Galligan advised the Committee that there were no accrual adjustments for the current accounting quarter.

#### 18.05 Selection of Ultimate Losses

##### Private Passenger Bodily Injury, Property Damage, and No Fault Pools

##### P.P. No Fault

##### Accident Years 2008 - 2009:

Ms. Lynellen Ramirez recommended that the average paid/incurred indications be selected as the current ultimate valuations for accident years 2008-2009.

**Accident Year 2010:**

Ms. Ramirez recommended the average paid/incurred indication. This resulted in an ultimate loss of \$0.4 million and a loss ratio of 2.024 including rate deviated premium for accident year 2010.

The Committee unanimously voted to accept the above recommendations for Private Passenger No Fault.

**P.P. Bodily Injury****Accident Years 2008 - 2009:**

Ms. Ramirez recommended that the average paid/incurred indications be selected as the current ultimate valuations for accident years 2008-2009.

**Accident Year 2010:**

Ms. Ramirez recommended the average paid/incurred indication. This resulted in an ultimate loss of \$0.8 million and a loss ratio of 0.874 including rate deviated premium for accident year 2010.

The Committee unanimously voted to accept the above recommendations for Private Passenger Bodily Injury.

**P.P. Property Damage Liability****Accident Years 2008 - 2009:**

Ms. Ramirez recommended that the average paid/incurred indications be selected as the current ultimate valuations for accident years 2008-2009.

**Accident Year 2010:**

Ms. Ramirez recommended the average paid/incurred indication. This resulted in an ultimate loss of \$0.6 million and a loss ratio of 0.663 including rate deviated premium for accident year 2010.

The Committee unanimously voted to accept the above recommendations for Private Passenger Property Damage Liability.

**Current ultimate valuations selected for P.P. Liability are:**

(Values in Millions)

AY	PPBI	PPNF	PPDDL	Total	AY LR	AY LR w/Rat Dev
2008	66.3	19.8	51.8	137.9	95.5	92.6
2009	26.1	8.6	20.0	54.8	98.3	91.3
2010	0.8	0.4	0.6	1.9	98.1	90.1

**Private Passenger Collision and Other Than Collision****P.P. Collision****Accident Years 2008 - 2009:**

Ms. Ramirez recommended that the average paid/incurred indications be selected as the current ultimate valuations for accident years 2008-2009.

**Accident Year 2010:**

Ms. Ramirez recommended selecting the paid indication of \$0.7 million for accident year 2010. This resulted in a loss ratio of 0.916 including rate deviated premium.

The Committee unanimously voted to accept the above recommendations for Private Passenger Collision.

**P.P. Other Than Collision**

**Accident Years 2008 - 2009:**

Ms. Ramirez recommended that the average paid/incurred indications be selected as the current ultimate valuations for accident years 2008-2009.

**Accident Year 2010:**

Ms. Ramirez recommended selecting the paid indication of \$0.3 million for accident year 2010. This resulted in a loss ratio of 0.842 including rate deviated premium.

The Committee unanimously voted to accept the above recommendations for Private Passenger Other Than Collision.

**Current ultimate valuations selected for P.P. Physical Damage are:**

(Values in Millions)

AY	PPCOLL	PPOTC	TOTAL	AY LR	AY LR w/Rat Dev
2008	49.9	18.8	68.7	101.4	98.6
2009	19.0	7.7	26.8	98.7	92.0
2010	0.7	0.3	0.9	95.7	89.4

**All Other Bodily Injury, Property Damage, and No Fault Pools**

**A.O. No Fault**

**Accident Years 2008 - 2010:**

Ms. Alyssa Potter recommended using the incurred loss projection based on the “latest 8 M-M” methodology for accident years 2008 - 2010.

**Accident Year 2011:**

Ms. Potter recommended using the average paid/incurred indication based on the “latest 8 M-M” methodology for accident year 2011.

**Accident Years 2012 - 2013:**

Ms. Potter recommended using the incurred loss projections based on the “latest 8 M-M” methodology for accident years 2012 - 2013.

**Accident Years 2014 - 2015:**

Ms. Potter recommended using the incurred loss projection based on the “latest 8” methodology for accident years 2014 - 2015.

**Accident Year 2016:**

Ms. Potter recommended using the average of prior quarter's selected loss ratio and the current quarter's incurred loss ratio projection based on the "latest 12" methodology for accident year 2016, resulting in a loss ratio of 1.097.

**Accident Year 2017:**

Ms. Potter using the average of prior quarter's selected loss ratio of 1.027 and the current quarter's incurred loss ratio projection based on the "latest 12 M-M" methodology of 0.910, resulting in a loss ratio of 0.968 and an ultimate loss of \$5.2 million for accident year 2017.

The Committee unanimously voted to accept the above recommendations for All Other No Fault.

**A.O. Bodily Injury**

**Accident Year 2008:**

Ms. Melissa Vaughn recommended using the incurred loss projection for accident year 2008.

**Accident Years 2009 - 2016:**

Ms. Vaughn recommended using the incurred loss projections based on the "latest 12 M-M" methodology for accident years 2009 - 2016.

**Accident Year 2017:**

Ms. Vaughn recommended using the incurred loss projection based on the "latest 12 with unity" methodology for accident year 2017, resulting in an ultimate loss of \$84.9 million and a loss ratio of 1.013.

The Committee unanimously voted to accept the above recommendations for All Other Bodily Injury.

**A.O. Property Damage Liability**

**Accident Years 2008 - 2016:**

Ms. Alyssa Potter recommended that the incurred loss projections based on the "latest 8 M-M" methodology for accident years 2008 - 2016.

**Accident Year 2017:**

Ms. Potter recommended using the incurred loss projection based on the "latest 8 M-M" methodology for accident year 2017, resulting in an ultimate loss of \$36.2 million, and a loss ratio of 0.841.

The Committee unanimously voted to accept the above recommendations for All Other Property Damage Liability.

**Current ultimate valuations selected for A.O. Liability are:**

(Values in Millions)

AY	AOBI	AONF	AOPDL	TOTAL	AY LR
2008	43.9	2.8	24.6	71.3	66.8
2009	41.1	3.0	16.1	60.1	70.0
2010	38.8	2.9	17.3	59.0	78.1
2011	38.0	2.6	18.4	59.0	84.5
2012	31.3	2.3	16.4	50.1	69.4
2013	42.8	3.1	18.6	64.4	80.2
2014	53.0	3.7	22.8	79.4	86.5
2015	50.7	4.2	29.2	84.1	79.1
2016	83.4	5.6	30.1	119.1	99.0
2017	84.9	5.2	36.2	126.3	95.5

**All Other Collision and Other Than Collision**

**A.O. Collision**

Mr. Warren Ehrlich was not in attendance, but forwarded his recommendations to the Chair prior to the meeting.

**Accident Years 2008 - 2016**

Mr. Ehrlich recommended using the average paid indications for accident years 2008 – 2016.

**Accident Year 2017:**

Mr. Ehrlich recommended using the average of the current quarter's indicated loss ratio and the prior quarter's selected loss ratio for accident year 2017. This results in a loss ratio of 0.918 and an ultimate loss of \$28.2 million.

The Committee unanimously voted to accept the above recommendations for A.O. Collision.

**A.O. Other Than Collision**

**Accident Years 2008 - 2015**

Mr. Ehrlich recommended using the average paid indications for accident years 2008 – 2015.

**Accident Year 2016:**

Mr. Ehrlich recommended using average of the current quarter's indicated loss and the prior quarter's selected ultimate loss for accident year 2016. This results in an ultimate loss of \$8.7 million.

**Accident Year 2017:**

Mr. Ehrlich recommended using 1/4 of the current quarter's indicated loss ratio and 3/4 of the prior quarter's selected loss ratio for accident year 2017. This results in a loss ratio of 0.736 and an ultimate loss of \$9.2 million.

The Committee unanimously voted to accept the above recommendations for A.O. Other Than Collision.

**Current ultimate valuations selected for A.O. Physical Damage are:**

(Values in Millions)

AY	AOCOLL	AOTC	TOTAL	AY LR
2008	13.1	6.2	19.3	58.4
2009	10.4	4.8	15.3	58.9
2010	10.2	4.6	14.8	72.9
2011	10.4	4.8	15.2	82.5
2012	9.8	6.1	15.9	81.8
2013	12.0	6.1	18.1	82.8
2014	14.6	7.0	21.6	83.1
2015	21.6	7.9	29.5	87.4
2016	25.7	8.7	34.4	86.1
2017	28.2	9.2	37.4	86.5

**18.06 Policy Year Deficit and Loss Ratio Report**

After reviewing the distribution of selected accident year ultimate losses to policy year, the Committee agreed to the following shift of reserves:

AO Bodily Injury	\$2,950,000 from PY 2015 to PY 2017
AO Bodily Injury	\$2,950,000 from PY 2015 to PY 2016
AO Bodily Injury	\$300,000 from PY 2015 to PY 2014
AO Bodily Injury	\$4,800,000 from PY 2013 to PY 2014
AO No Fault	\$125,000 from PY 2017 to PY 2016
AO No Fault	\$225,000 from PY 2015 to PY 2016
AO No Fault	\$100,000 from PY 2015 to PY 2013
AO No Fault	\$50,000 from PY 2014 to PY 2013
AO PDL	\$700,000 from PY 2016 to PY 2017
AO PDL	\$400,000 from PY 2016 to PY 2015
AO Collision	\$500,000 from PY 2016 to PY 2017
AO Collision	\$400,000 from PY 2015 to PY 2017
AO OTC	\$50,000 from PY 2016 to PY 2017
AO OTC	\$25,000 from PY 2015 to PY 2017

The final version of the Policy Year Deficit and Loss Ratio reports of the Loss Reserving Committee to the Governing Committee are available. (Docket #LR18.06, Exhibit #1) and (Docket #LR18.05, Exhibit #17)

## **18.07 Latest Valuation of Ultimate Projections**

The latest deficit projections for policy years 2015, 2016, and 2017 were reviewed and finalized as follows:

	<u>Commercial (in millions)</u>
2017	(\$31.4)
2016	(\$41.6)
2015	(\$13.9)

Please refer to (Docket #LR18.07, Exhibit #3) for additional details relating to the policy year ultimate deficits for 2015-2017.

### **Premium Projections**

Mr. Galligan reviewed the ultimate premium and ultimate expense ratios contained in the current quarter's Policy Year Deficit Projections exhibit as follows:

#### **Policy Year 2015**

Policy year 2015 commercial ultimate premium is estimated using an average of the annual and quarterly premium development methods. The premium estimate decreased \$100,000 from the prior quarter.

#### **Policy Year 2016**

Policy year 2016 commercial ultimate premium is estimated using an average of the annual and quarterly premium development methods. The premium estimate decreased \$400,000 from the prior quarter.

#### **Policy Year 2017**

Policy year 2017 commercial ultimate premium is estimated using an average of the annual and quarterly premium development methods. The premium estimate increased \$800,000 from the prior quarter.

### **Loss Ratios**

The ultimate loss ratios for policy years 2015-2017 are set equal to the selected loss ratios as of the quarter ending December 31, 2018.

### **Expense Ratios**

#### **Policy Years 2015 and 2016**

Policy years 2015 and 2016 expense ratios are set equal to the latest reported value, which reflects all true-up adjustments to date.

#### **Policy Year 2017**

The policy year 2017 ultimate expense ratio of 25.1% is a weighted average of expenses for both commercial risks, taxis, limousines, and car service.

The commercial expense ratio is based on the approved expense allowance of \$396 per exposure converted to a percent of premium, plus premium tax and commission.

The taxi/limousine/car service expense ratios are based on the approved expense allowances converted to a percent of premium plus premium tax and commission. The expense allowance per exposure amounts are \$1,082 for taxi, \$601 for limousine, and \$701 for car service.

SHANNON CHIU  
Actuarial/Statistical Analyst

Attachments

Boston, Massachusetts  
March 30, 2018



QUARTER ENDING: DECEMBER 31, 2017

EXHIBIT # 1

PAGE 1 Of 4

<b>Private Passenger LIABILITY</b>	<b><u>PY 2017</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2016</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2015</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2014</u></b>
	@ 12 Mos	@ 24 Mos		
Written Premium	0	0	0	0
Written Premium Accrued	0	0	0	0
Unearned Premium Current	0	0	0	0
Total Earned Premium	0	0	0	0
Reported Losses	0	0	0	0
I.B.N.R. Reserve	0	0	0	0
Total Incurred Losses	0	0	0	0
Loss Ratio	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
Ceding Expenses & Commissions	0	0	0	0
Ceding Expenses Accrued	0	0	0	0
Rate Deviation	0	0	0	0
Rate Deviation Expense All.	0	0	0	0
Deferred Acquisition Costs	0	0	0	0
Expense Ratio to Earned Premium	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
C.A.R. Underwriting Deficit	0	0	0	0
<b>Private Passenger PHYSICAL DAMAGE</b>	<b><u>PY 2017</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2016</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2015</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2014</u></b>
	@ 12 Mos	@ 24 Mos		
Written Premium	0	0	0	0
Written Premium Accrued	0	0	0	0
Unearned Premium Current	0	0	0	0
Total Earned Premium	0	0	0	0
Reported Losses	0	0	0	0
I.B.N.R. Reserve	0	0	0	0
Total Incurred Losses	0	0	0	0
Loss Ratio	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
Ceding Expenses & Commissions	0	0	0	0
Ceding Expenses Accrued	0	0	0	0
Rate Deviation	0	0	0	0
Rate Deviation Expense All.	0	0	0	0
Deferred Acquisition Costs	0	0	0	0
Expense Ratio to Earned Premium	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
C.A.R. Underwriting Deficit	0	0	0	0
<b>Private Passenger ALL</b>	<b><u>PY 2017</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2016</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2015</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2014</u></b>
	@ 12 Mos	@ 24 Mos		
Written Premium	0	0	0	0
Written Premium Accrued	0	0	0	0
Unearned Premium Current	0	0	0	0
Total Earned Premium	0	0	0	0
Reported Losses	0	0	0	0
I.B.N.R. Reserve	0	0	0	0
Total Incurred Losses	0	0	0	0
Loss Ratio	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
Ceding Expenses & Commissions	0	0	0	0
Ceding Expenses Accrued	0	0	0	0
Rate Deviation	0	0	0	0
Rate Deviation Expense All.	0	0	0	0
Deferred Acquisition Costs	0	0	0	0
Expense Ratio to Earned Premium	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
C.A.R. Underwriting Deficit	0	0	0	0

QUARTER ENDING: DECEMBER 31, 2017

EXHIBIT # 1

PAGE 2 Of 4

<b>Private Passenger LIABILITY</b>	<b><u>PY 2013</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2012</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2011</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2010</u></b>
Written Premium	0	0	0	0
Written Premium Accrued	0	0	0	0
Unearned Premium Current	0	0	0	0
Total Earned Premium	0	0	0	0
Reported Losses	0	0	0	0
I.B.N.R. Reserve	0	0	0	0
Total Incurred Losses	0	0	0	0
Loss Ratio	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
Ceding Expenses & Commissions	0	0	0	0
Ceding Expenses Accrued	0	0	0	0
Rate Deviation	0	0	0	0
Rate Deviation Expense All.	0	0	0	0
Deferred Acquisition Costs	0	0	0	0
Expense Ratio to Earned Premium	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
C.A.R. Underwriting Deficit	0	0	0	0
<b>Private Passenger PHYSICAL DAMAGE</b>	<b><u>PY 2013</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2012</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2011</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2010</u></b>
Written Premium	0	0	0	0
Written Premium Accrued	0	0	0	0
Unearned Premium Current	0	0	0	0
Total Earned Premium	0	0	0	0
Reported Losses	0	0	0	0
I.B.N.R. Reserve	0	0	0	0
Total Incurred Losses	0	0	0	0
Loss Ratio	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
Ceding Expenses & Commissions	0	0	0	0
Ceding Expenses Accrued	0	0	0	0
Rate Deviation	0	0	0	0
Rate Deviation Expense All.	0	0	0	0
Deferred Acquisition Costs	0	0	0	0
Expense Ratio to Earned Premium	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
C.A.R. Underwriting Deficit	0	0	0	0
<b>Private Passenger ALL</b>	<b><u>PY 2013</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2012</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2011</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2010</u></b>
Written Premium	0	0	0	0
Written Premium Accrued	0	0	0	0
Unearned Premium Current	0	0	0	0
Total Earned Premium	0	0	0	0
Reported Losses	0	0	0	0
I.B.N.R. Reserve	0	0	0	0
Total Incurred Losses	0	0	0	0
Loss Ratio	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
Ceding Expenses & Commissions	0	0	0	0
Ceding Expenses Accrued	0	0	0	0
Rate Deviation	0	0	0	0
Rate Deviation Expense All.	0	0	0	0
Deferred Acquisition Costs	0	0	0	0
Expense Ratio to Earned Premium	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
C.A.R. Underwriting Deficit	0	0	0	0

QUARTER ENDING: DECEMBER 31, 2017

EXHIBIT # 1

PAGE 3 Of 4

<b>All Other LIABILITY</b>	<b><u>PY 2017</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2016</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2015</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2014</u></b>
	@ 12 Mos	@ 24 Mos		
Written Premium	139,958	127,545	113,790	98,439
Written Premium Accrued	0	0	0	0
Unearned Premium Current	72,124	0	0	0
Total Earned Premium	67,834	127,545	113,790	98,439
Reported Losses	35,835	102,171	90,770	74,518
I.B.N.R. Reserve	28,523	28,403	3,075	7,726
Total Incurred Losses	64,358	130,574	93,845	82,244
Loss Ratio	0.949	1.024	0.825	0.835
Ceding Expenses & Commissions	35,836	32,504	29,102	25,700
Ceding Expenses Accrued	0	0	0	0
Deferred Acquisition Costs	18,467	0	0	0
Expense Ratio to Earned Premium	0.256	0.255	0.256	0.261
C.A.R. Underwriting Deficit	(13,893)	(35,533)	(9,157)	(9,505)
<b>All Other PHYSICAL DAMAGE</b>	<b><u>PY 2017</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2016</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2015</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2014</u></b>
	@ 12 Mos	@ 24 Mos		
Written Premium	45,235	41,693	37,649	29,499
Written Premium Accrued	0	0	0	0
Unearned Premium Current	23,038	0	0	0
Total Earned Premium	22,197	41,693	37,649	29,499
Reported Losses	16,476	38,397	33,272	24,401
I.B.N.R. Reserve	2,168	(1,332)	(552)	(7)
Total Incurred Losses	18,644	37,065	32,720	24,394
Loss Ratio	0.840	0.889	0.869	0.827
Ceding Expenses & Commissions	11,650	10,683	9,676	7,752
Ceding Expenses Accrued	0	0	0	0
Deferred Acquisition Costs	5,933	0	0	0
Expense Ratio to Earned Premium	0.258	0.256	0.257	0.263
C.A.R. Underwriting Deficit	(2,164)	(6,055)	(4,747)	(2,647)
<b>All Other ALL</b>	<b><u>PY 2017</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2016</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2015</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2014</u></b>
	@ 12 Mos	@ 24 Mos		
Written Premium	185,193	169,238	151,439	127,938
Written Premium Accrued	0	0	0	0
Unearned Premium Current	95,162	0	0	0
Total Earned Premium	90,031	169,238	151,439	127,938
Reported Losses	52,311	140,568	124,042	98,919
I.B.N.R. Reserve	30,691	27,071	2,523	7,719
Total Incurred Losses	83,002	167,639	126,565	106,638
Loss Ratio	0.922	0.991	0.836	0.834
Ceding Expenses & Commissions	47,486	43,187	38,778	33,452
Ceding Expenses Accrued	0	0	0	0
Deferred Acquisition Costs	24,400	0	0	0
Expense Ratio to Earned Premium	0.256	0.255	0.256	0.261
C.A.R. Underwriting Deficit	(16,057)	(41,588)	(13,904)	(12,152)

QUARTER ENDING: DECEMBER 31, 2017

EXHIBIT # 1

PAGE 4 Of 4

<b>All Other LIABILITY</b>	<b><u>PY 2013</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2012</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2011</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2010</u></b>
Written Premium	86,656	74,631	70,343	72,872
Written Premium Accrued	0	0	0	0
Unearned Premium Current	0	0	0	0
Total Earned Premium	86,656	74,631	70,343	72,872
Reported Losses	77,062	60,557	55,557	53,227
I.B.N.R. Reserve	(3,483)	(1,179)	(80)	2
Total Incurred Losses	73,579	59,378	55,477	53,229
Loss Ratio	0.849	0.796	0.789	0.730
Ceding Expenses & Commissions	23,309	20,438	20,549	22,215
Ceding Expenses Accrued	0	0	0	0
Deferred Acquisition Costs	0	0	0	0
Expense Ratio to Earned Premium	0.269	0.274	0.292	0.305
C.A.R. Underwriting Deficit	(10,232)	(5,185)	(5,683)	(2,572)
<b>All Other PHYSICAL DAMAGE</b>	<b><u>PY 2013</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2012</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2011</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2010</u></b>
Written Premium	23,856	20,439	18,611	18,947
Written Premium Accrued	0	0	0	0
Unearned Premium Current	0	0	0	0
Total Earned Premium	23,856	20,439	18,611	18,947
Reported Losses	20,286	17,376	15,275	14,458
I.B.N.R. Reserve	1	0	0	0
Total Incurred Losses	20,287	17,376	15,275	14,458
Loss Ratio	0.850	0.850	0.821	0.763
Ceding Expenses & Commissions	6,475	5,657	6,062	6,838
Ceding Expenses Accrued	0	0	0	0
Deferred Acquisition Costs	0	0	0	0
Expense Ratio to Earned Premium	0.271	0.277	0.326	0.361
C.A.R. Underwriting Deficit	(2,906)	(2,594)	(2,726)	(2,349)
<b>All Other ALL</b>	<b><u>PY 2013</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2012</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2011</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2010</u></b>
Written Premium	110,512	95,070	88,954	91,819
Written Premium Accrued	0	0	0	0
Unearned Premium Current	0	0	0	0
Total Earned Premium	110,512	95,070	88,954	91,819
Reported Losses	97,348	77,933	70,832	67,685
I.B.N.R. Reserve	(3,482)	(1,179)	(80)	2
Total Incurred Losses	93,866	76,754	70,752	67,687
Loss Ratio	0.849	0.807	0.795	0.737
Ceding Expenses & Commissions	29,784	26,095	26,611	29,053
Ceding Expenses Accrued	0	0	0	0
Deferred Acquisition Costs	0	0	0	0
Expense Ratio to Earned Premium	0.270	0.274	0.299	0.316
C.A.R. Underwriting Deficit	(13,138)	(7,779)	(8,409)	(4,921)



















	<b>P.P. Bodily Injury</b>		<b>P.P. No Fault</b>		<b>P.P. Property Damage</b>		<b>P.P. Liability</b>	
	<u>AY 2009</u>	<u>AY 2008</u>	<u>AY 2009</u>	<u>AY 2008</u>	<u>AY 2009</u>	<u>AY 2008</u>	<u>AY 2009</u>	<u>AY 2008</u>
Ultimate Loss	26,065	66,297	8,642	19,753	20,049	51,832	54,756	137,882
Distrib Q-1	10,126	18,170	3,410	5,795	8,651	14,939		
from Q-2	8,179	18,254	2,483	5,231	5,826	14,383		
Avg. of Q-3	5,159	16,511	1,703	4,830	3,419	11,808		
Pd/Inc. Q-4	2,601	13,362	1,046	3,897	2,153	10,702		
Total	26,065	66,297	8,642	19,753	20,049	51,832		
Alternate Distribution:								
Q-1	0	0	0	0	0	0		
Q-2	0	0	0	0	0	0		
Q-3	0	0	0	0	0	0		
Q-4	0	0	0	0	0	0		
Total	0	0	0	0	0	0		
AY IBNR Q-1	(14)	0	0	(5)	0	0	(14)	(5)
Q-2	0	(30)	(2)	0	0	0	(2)	(30)
Q-3	0	(1)	0	0	0	0	0	(1)
Q-4	(1)	0	0	0	0	0	(1)	0
Total	(15)	(31)	(2)	(5)	0	0	(17)	(36)
CY Earn Prem	25,706	66,041	5,633	14,749	24,365	63,605	55,704	144,395
AY Loss Ratio	1.014	1.004	1.534	1.339	0.823	0.815	0.983	0.955
Prior Ratio	1.014	1.004	1.534	1.339	0.823	0.815	0.983	0.955
AY LR w/Rat Dev	0.933	0.971	1.417	1.294	0.774	0.793	0.913	0.926
Prior AY LR w/Rat Dev	0.933	0.971	1.417	1.294	0.774	0.793	0.913	0.926
<b>P.Y. IBNR</b>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>
Q-1	(14)	0	0	(5)	0	0	(14)	(5)
Q-2	0	(30)	(2)	0	0	0	(2)	(30)
Q-3	0	(1)	0	0	0	0	0	(1)
Q-4	(1)	0	0	0	0	0	(1)	0
Total	(15)	(31)	(2)	(5)	0	0	(17)	(36)
Shifted Amount	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Final PY IBNR	(15)	(31)	(2)	(5)	0	0	(17)	(36)
	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>
PY Earn Prem	9,007	47,470	1,986	10,485	8,483	45,480	19,476	103,435
PY Pd + OS Loss	10,344	51,708	3,595	15,303	7,702	39,361	21,641	106,372
PY PD/OS/IBNR	10,329	51,677	3,593	15,298	7,702	39,361	21,624	106,336
PY Loss Ratio	1.147	1.089	1.809	1.459	0.908	0.865	1.110	1.028
Prior PY Loss Ratio	1.146	1.089	1.809	1.459	0.908	0.865	1.110	1.028
PY LR w/ RatDev	1.032	1.018	1.638	1.362	0.839	0.822	1.011	0.968
Prior PY LR w/ RatDev	1.032	1.018	1.638	1.362	0.839	0.822	1.011	0.968

	<b>P.P. Collision</b>		<b>P.P. Comprehensive</b>		<b>P.P. Physical Damage</b>		<b>Total Priv. Passenger</b>	
	<u>AY 2009</u>	<u>AY 2008</u>	<u>AY 2009</u>	<u>AY 2008</u>	<u>AY 2009</u>	<u>AY 2008</u>	<u>AY 2009</u>	<u>AY 2008</u>
Ultimate Loss	19,033	49,892	7,732	18,816	26,765	68,708	81,521	206,590
Distrib Q-1	8,920	15,968	2,938	5,220				
from Q-2	4,672	12,520	2,342	4,928				
Avg. of Q-3	3,279	10,877	1,591	4,799				
Pd/Inc. Q-4	2,162	10,527	861	3,869				
Total	19,033	49,892	7,732	18,816				
Alternate Distribution:								
Q-1	0	0	0	0				
Q-2	0	0	0	0				
Q-3	0	0	0	0				
Q-4	0	0	0	0				
Total	0	0	0	0				
AY IBNR Q-1	0	0	0	0	0	0	(14)	(5)
Q-2	0	0	0	0	0	0	(2)	(30)
Q-3	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	(1)
Q-4	0	0	0	0	0	0	(1)	0
Total	0	0	0	0	0	0	(17)	(36)
CY Earn Prem	19,899	51,330	7,217	16,407	27,116	67,737	82,820	212,132
AY Loss Ratio	0.956	0.972	1.071	1.147	0.987	1.014	0.984	0.974
Prior Ratio	0.957	0.972	1.071	1.147	0.987	1.014	0.984	0.974
AY LR w/Rat Dev	0.904	0.950	0.962	1.099	0.920	0.986	0.916	0.945
Prior AY LR w/Rat Dev	0.904	0.950	0.962	1.099	0.920	0.986	0.916	0.945
<b>P.Y. IBNR</b>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>
Q-1	0	0	0	0	0	0	(14)	(5)
Q-2	0	0	0	0	0	0	(2)	(30)
Q-3	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	(1)
Q-4	0	0	0	0	0	0	(1)	0
Total	0	0	0	0	0	0	(17)	(36)
Shifted Amount	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Final PY IBNR	0	0	0	0	0	0	(17)	(36)
	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>
PY Earn Prem	6,785	36,532	2,535	12,426	9,320	48,958	28,796	152,393
PY Pd + OS Loss	6,754	37,737	2,717	14,528	9,471	52,265	31,112	158,637
PY PD/OS/IBNR	6,754	37,737	2,717	14,528	9,471	52,265	31,095	158,601
PY Loss Ratio	0.995	1.033	1.072	1.169	1.016	1.068	1.080	1.041
Prior PY Loss Ratio	0.995	1.033	1.072	1.169	1.016	1.068	1.080	1.041
PY LR w/ RatDev	0.931	0.987	0.939	1.070	0.933	1.009	0.986	0.981
Prior PY LR w/ RatDev	0.931	0.987	0.939	1.070	0.933	1.009	0.986	0.981

























COMMERCIAL ULTIMATE POLICY YEAR DEFICIT PROJECTIONS  
 BASED ON DATA REPORTED THROUGH QUARTER ENDING DECEMBER 2017  
 (000's OMITTED)

DOCKET #: LR 18.07  
 EXHIBIT #: 3  
 PAGE: 1 of 2

SUMMARY EXHIBIT

	Policy Year 2015		Policy Year 2016		Policy Year 2017	
	Dollars	% Prem	Dollars	% Prem	Dollars	% Prem
Premium	151,400	100.0%	169,000	100.0%	181,700	100.0%
Losses Incurred and ALAE	126,571	83.6%	167,479	99.1%	167,527	92.2%
Underwriting Expenses	38,768	25.6%	43,126	25.5%	45,607	25.1%
Underwriting Result	(13,939)	-9.2%	(41,605)	-24.6%	(31,434)	-17.3%

COMPARISON OF ULTIMATE POLICY YEAR DEFICIT PROJECTIONS  
PRIOR AND CURRENT QUARTER ESTIMATES

DOCKET #: LR 18.07  
EXHIBIT #: 3  
PAGE: 2 of 2

Policy Year 2017

	Prior Qtr Estimate		Current Qtr Estimate		Variance	
	Dollars	% Prem	Dollars	% Prem	Dollars	Percent
Premium	180,900	100.0%	181,700	100.0%	800	0.4%
Losses Incurred and ALAE	163,172	90.2%	167,527	92.2%	4,355	2.7%
Underwriting Expenses	45,406	25.1%	45,607	25.1%	201	0.4%
Underwriting Result	(27,678)	-15.3%	(31,434)	-17.3%	(3,756)	13.6%

Policy Year 2016

	Prior Qtr Estimate		Current Qtr Estimate		Variance	
	Dollars	% Prem	Dollars	% Prem	Dollars	Percent
Premium	169,400	100.0%	169,000	100.0%	(400)	-0.2%
Losses Incurred and ALAE	161,269	95.2%	167,479	99.1%	6,210	3.9%
Underwriting Expenses	43,197	25.5%	43,126	25.5%	(71)	-0.2%
Underwriting Result	(35,066)	-20.7%	(41,605)	-24.6%	(6,539)	18.6%

Policy Year 2015

	Prior Qtr Estimate		Current Qtr Estimate		Variance	
	Dollars	% Prem	Dollars	% Prem	Dollars	Percent
Premium	151,500	100.0%	151,400	100.0%	(100)	-0.1%
Losses Incurred and ALAE	126,352	83.4%	126,571	83.6%	219	0.2%
Underwriting Expenses	38,784	25.6%	38,768	25.6%	(16)	0.0%
Underwriting Result	(13,636)	-9.0%	(13,939)	-9.2%	(303)	2.2%