



NATALIE A. HUBLEY  
PRESIDENT

COMMONWEALTH AUTOMOBILE REINSURERS

101 Arch Street, Suite 400 Boston, Massachusetts 02110  
www.commauto.com 617-338-4000

## RECORDS OF MEETING

### LOSS RESERVING COMMITTEE – SEPTEMBER 6, 2017

#### Members Present

Ms. Lynellen Ramirez – Chair	Arbella Insurance Group
Mr. Jonathan Blake <sup>(1)</sup>	The Hanover Insurance Company
Ms. Melissa Vaughn <sup>(2)</sup>	Safety Insurance Company

#### Substituted for:

<sup>(1)</sup> Ms. Alyssa Potter  
<sup>(2)</sup> Mr. Glenn Hiltbold

#### Not in Attendance:

Mr. Warren Ehrlich, MAPFRE U.S.A. Corporation

#### 17.01 Records of Previous Meeting

The Committee unanimously voted to approve the Records of the Loss Reserving Committee meeting of June 7, 2017. The Records have been distributed and are on file.

#### 17.04 Quality of Current Quarter Reporting

Ms. Katy Proctor advised the Committee that there were no accrual adjustments for the current accounting quarter.

#### 17.05 Selection of Ultimate Losses

##### Private Passenger Bodily Injury, Property Damage, and No Fault Pools

##### P.P. No Fault

##### Accident Years 2008 - 2009:

Ms. Lynellen Ramirez recommended that the average paid/incurred indications be selected as the current ultimate valuations for accident years 2008-2009.

##### Accident Year 2010:

Ms. Ramirez recommended the average paid/incurred indication. This resulted in an ultimate loss of \$0.4 million and a loss ratio of 2.024 including rate deviated premium for accident year 2010.

The Committee unanimously voted to accept the above recommendations for Private Passenger No Fault.

**P.P. Bodily Injury**

**Accident Years 2008 - 2009:**

Ms. Ramirez recommended that the average paid/incurred indications be selected as the current ultimate valuations for accident years 2008-2009.

**Accident Year 2010:**

Ms. Ramirez recommended the average paid/incurred indication. This resulted in an ultimate loss of \$0.8 million and a loss ratio of 0.874 including rate deviated premium for accident year 2010.

The Committee unanimously voted to accept the above recommendations for Private Passenger Bodily Injury.

**P.P. Property Damage Liability**

**Accident Years 2008 - 2009:**

Ms. Ramirez recommended that the average paid/incurred indications be selected as the current ultimate valuations for accident years 2008-2009.

**Accident Year 2010:**

Ms. Ramirez recommended the average paid/incurred indication. This resulted in an ultimate loss of \$0.6 million and a loss ratio of 0.663 including rate deviated premium for accident year 2010.

The Committee unanimously voted to accept the above recommendations for Private Passenger Property Damage Liability.

**Current ultimate valuations selected for P.P. Liability are:**

(Values in Millions)

AY	PPBI	PPNF	PPDDL	Total	AY LR	AY LR w/Rat Dev
2008	66.3	19.8	51.8	137.9	95.5	92.6
2009	26.1	8.6	20.0	54.8	98.3	91.3
2010	0.8	0.4	0.6	1.9	98.1	90.1

**Private Passenger Collision and Other Than Collision**

**P.P. Collision**

**Accident Years 2008 - 2009:**

Ms. Ramirez recommended that the average paid/incurred indications be selected as the current ultimate valuations for accident years 2008-2009.

**Accident Year 2010:**

Ms. Ramirez recommended selecting the paid indication of \$0.7 million for accident year 2010. This resulted in a loss ratio of 0.916 including rate deviated premium.

The Committee unanimously voted to accept the above recommendations for Private Passenger Collision.

**P.P. Other Than Collision**

**Accident Years 2008 - 2009:**

Ms. Ramirez recommended that the average paid/incurred indications be selected as the current ultimate valuations for accident years 2008-2009.

**Accident Year 2010:**

Ms. Ramirez recommended selecting the paid indication of \$0.3 million for accident year 2010. This resulted in a loss ratio of 0.842 including rate deviated premium.

The Committee unanimously voted to accept the above recommendations for Private Passenger Other Than Collision.

**Current ultimate valuations selected for P.P. Physical Damage are:**

(Values in Millions)

AY	PPCOLL	PPOTC	TOTAL	AY LR	AY LR w/Rat Dev
2008	49.9	18.8	68.7	101.4	98.6
2009	19.0	7.7	26.8	98.7	92.0
2010	0.7	0.3	0.9	95.7	89.4

**All Other Bodily Injury, Property Damage, and No Fault Pools**

**A.O. No Fault**

**Accident Years 2008 - 2011:**

Mr. Jonathan Blake recommended using the incurred loss projection based on the “latest 8 M-M” methodology for accident years 2008 - 2011.

**Accident Years 2012 - 2013:**

Mr. Blake recommended using the incurred loss projections based on the “latest 8” methodology for accident years 2010 - 2012.

**Accident Years 2014 - 2015:**

Mr. Blake recommended using the incurred loss projection based on the “latest 8 M-M” methodology for accident years 2014 - 2015.

**Accident Year 2016:**

Mr. Blake recommended using the average paid/incurred indication based on the “latest 8 M-M” methodology for accident year 2016.

**Accident Year 2017:**

Mr. Blake recommended using the incurred loss projection based on the “latest 12” methodology for accident year 2017, resulting in an ultimate loss of \$3.0 million and a loss ratio of 1.111.

The Committee unanimously voted to accept the above recommendations for All Other No Fault.

## **A.O. Bodily Injury**

### **Accident Year 2008:**

Ms. Melissa Vaughn recommended using the incurred loss projection for accident year 2008.

### **Accident Years 2009 - 2010:**

Ms. Vaughn recommended using the incurred loss projections based on the “latest 12 M-M” methodology for accident years 2009 - 2010.

### **Accident Years 2011 - 2012:**

Ms. Vaughn recommended using the incurred loss projections based on the “latest 12” methodology for accident years 2011 - 2012.

### **Accident Years 2013 - 2014:**

Ms. Vaughn recommended using the incurred loss projections based on the “latest 8 M-M” methodology for accident years 2013 - 2014.

### **Accident Year 2015:**

Ms. Vaughn recommended using the prior quarter’s selected ultimate loss for accident year 2015.

### **Accident Year 2016:**

Ms. Vaughn recommended using the incurred loss projection based on the “latest 8 M-M” methodology for accident year 2016.

Ms. Ramirez noted large claims expecting further development, as compared to the prior quarter and Committee members were comfortable with a higher selected loss ratio selection for accident year 2016.

### **Accident Year 2017:**

Ms. Vaughn recommended using the incurred loss projection based on the “latest 8 M-M” methodology for accident year 2017, resulting in an ultimate loss of \$38.8 million and a loss ratio of 0.933.

The Committee unanimously voted to accept the above recommendations for All Other Bodily Injury.

## **A.O. Property Damage Liability**

### **Accident Years 2008 - 2012:**

Mr. Jonathan Blake recommended that the incurred loss projections based on the “latest 8 M-M” methodology for accident years 2008 - 2012.

### **Accident Year 2013:**

Mr. Blake recommended that the incurred loss projection based on the “latest 12 M-M” methodology for accident year 2013.

### **Accident Years 2014 - 2016:**

Mr. Blake recommended that the incurred loss projections based on the “latest 8 M-M” methodology for accident years 2014 - 2016.

**Accident Year 2017:**

Mr. Blake recommended using the incurred loss projection based on the “latest 12 M-M” methodology for accident year 2017, resulting in an ultimate loss of \$17.9 million, and a loss ratio of 0.860.

The Committee unanimously voted to accept the above recommendations for All Other Property Damage Liability.

**Current ultimate valuations selected for A.O. Liability are:**

(Values in Millions)

AY	AOBI	AONF	AOPDL	TOTAL	AY LR
2008	43.9	2.8	24.6	71.3	66.8
2009	41.1	3.0	16.1	60.1	70.0
2010	38.8	2.9	17.3	59.0	78.1
2011	37.9	2.6	18.4	58.9	84.4
2012	32.2	2.3	16.4	50.9	70.6
2013	42.6	3.1	18.6	64.2	80.0
2014	51.6	3.7	22.7	78.0	84.9
2015	51.7	4.4	28.8	84.9	79.8
2016	75.2	6.0	29.9	111.2	92.4
2017	38.8	3.0	17.9	59.6	91.7

**All Other Collision and Other Than Collision****A.O. Collision**

Mr. Warren Ehrlich was not in attendance, but forwarded his recommendations to the Chair prior to the meeting.

**Accident Years 2008 - 2015**

Mr. Ehrlich recommended using the average paid indications for accident years 2008 – 2015.

**Accident Year 2016:**

Mr. Ehrlich recommended using average of the current quarter’s indicated loss and the prior quarter’s selected ultimate loss for accident year 2016. This results in an ultimate loss of \$25.9 million.

**Accident Year 2017:**

Mr. Ehrlich recommended using the average paid indication for accident year 2017. This results in an ultimate loss of \$13.6 million and a loss ratio of 0.908.

The Committee unanimously voted to accept the above recommendations for A.O. Collision.

**A.O. Other Than Collision****Accident Years 2008 - 2015**

Mr. Ehrlich recommended using the average paid indications for accident years 2008 – 2015.

**Accident Year 2016:**

Mr. Ehrlich recommended using average of the current quarter’s indicated loss and the prior quarter’s selected ultimate loss for accident year 2016. This results in an ultimate loss of \$8.8 million.

**Accident Year 2017:**

Mr. Ehrlich recommended using average of the current quarter’s indicated loss ratio and the prior quarter’s selected loss ratio for accident year 2017. This results in a loss ratio of 0.763 and an ultimate loss of \$4.7 million.

The Committee unanimously voted to accept the above recommendations for A.O. Other Than Collision.

**Current ultimate valuations selected for A.O. Physical Damage are:**

(Values in Millions)

AY	AOCOLL	AOOTC	TOTAL	AY LR
2008	13.1	6.2	19.3	58.4
2009	10.4	4.8	15.3	58.9
2010	10.2	4.6	14.8	72.9
2011	10.4	4.8	15.2	82.5
2012	9.8	6.1	15.9	81.9
2013	12.0	6.1	18.1	82.7
2014	14.6	7.0	21.6	83.0
2015	21.5	7.9	29.5	87.3
2016	25.9	8.8	34.7	86.8
2017	13.6	4.7	18.4	86.6

**17.06 Policy Year Deficit and Loss Ratio Report**

After reviewing the distribution of selected accident year ultimate losses to policy year, the Committee agreed to the following shift of reserves:

AO Bodily Injury	\$300,000 from PY 2017 to PY 2016
AO Bodily Injury	\$2,700,000 from PY 2015 to PY 2016
AO Bodily Injury	\$100,000 from PY 2015 to PY 2014
AO Bodily Injury	\$2,900,000 from PY 2013 to PY 2014
AO No Fault	\$50,000 from PY 2017 to PY 2015
AO No Fault	\$25,000 from PY 2014 to PY 2016
AO No Fault	\$100,000 from PY 2014 to PY 2013
AO No Fault	\$100,000 from PY 2012 to PY 2013
AO PDL	\$350,000 from PY 2016 to PY 2017
AO PDL	\$200,000 from PY 2016 to PY 2015
AO Collision	\$500,000 from PY 2017 to PY 2015
AO OTC	\$150,000 from PY 2016 to PY 2017
AO OTC	\$75,000 from PY 2015 to PY 2014
AO OTC	\$300,000 from PY 2013 to PY 2014

The final version of the Policy Year Deficit and Loss Ratio reports of the Loss Reserving Committee to the Governing Committee are available. (Docket #LR17.06, Exhibit #3) and (Docket #LR17.05, Exhibit #55)

### **17.07 Latest Valuation of Ultimate Projections**

The latest deficit projections for policy years 2014, 2015, and 2016 were reviewed and finalized as follows:

	<u>Commercial (in millions)</u>
2016	(\$33.1)
2015	(\$13.5)
2014	(\$11.1)

Please refer to (Docket #LR17.07, Exhibit #11) for additional details relating to the policy year ultimate deficits for 2014-2016.

### **Premium Projections**

Mr. Galligan reviewed the ultimate premium and ultimate expense ratios contained in the current quarter's Policy Year Deficit Projections exhibit as follows:

#### **Policy Year 2014**

Policy year 2014 commercial ultimate premium is estimated using the annual premium development method. The premium estimate is unchanged from the prior quarter.

#### **Policy Year 2015**

Policy year 2015 commercial ultimate premium is estimated using an average of the annual and quarterly premium development methods. The premium estimate is unchanged from the prior quarter.

#### **Policy Year 2016**

Policy year 2016 commercial ultimate premium is estimated using an average of the annual and quarterly premium development methods. The premium has decreased \$100,000 since last quarter's projection.

### **Loss Ratios**

The ultimate loss ratios for policy years 2014-2016 are set equal to the selected loss ratios, and will be updated at the meeting to reflect the selected loss ratios as of the quarter ending June 30, 2017.

### **Expense Ratios**

#### **Policy Years 2014 and 2015**

Policy years 2014 and 2015 expense ratios are set equal to the latest reported value, which reflects all true-up adjustments to date.

**Policy Year 2016**

The policy year 2016 ultimate expense ratio of 25.5 is a weighted average of 25.8% for commercial risks, 23.3% for taxis, 23.3% for limousines, and 18.5% for car service.

The commercial expense ratio is based on the approved expense allowance of \$388 per exposure converted to a percent of premium, plus premium tax and commission.

The taxi/limousine/car service expense ratios are based on the approved expense allowances converted to a percent of premium plus premium tax and commission. The expense allowance per exposure amounts are \$1,082 for taxi, \$601 for limousine, and \$701 for car service.

SHANNON CHIU  
Actuarial/Statistical Analyst

Attachments

Boston, Massachusetts  
September 15, 2017



QUARTER ENDING: JUNE 30, 2017

EXHIBIT # 3

PAGE 1 Of 4

<b>Private Passenger LIABILITY</b>	<b><u>PY 2017</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2016</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2015</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2014</u></b>
	@06 Mos	@18 Mos		
Written Premium	0	0	0	0
Written Premium Accrued	0	0	0	0
Unearned Premium Current	0	0	0	0
Total Earned Premium	0	0	0	0
Reported Losses	0	0	0	0
I.B.N.R. Reserve	0	0	0	0
Total Incurred Losses	0	0	0	0
Loss Ratio	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
Ceding Expenses & Commissions	0	0	0	0
Ceding Expenses Accrued	0	0	0	0
Rate Deviation	0	0	0	0
Rate Deviation Expense All.	0	0	0	0
Deferred Acquisition Costs	0	0	0	0
Expense Ratio to Earned Premium	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
C.A.R. Underwriting Deficit	0	0	0	0
<b>Private Passenger PHYSICAL DAMAGE</b>	<b><u>PY 2017</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2016</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2015</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2014</u></b>
	@06 Mos	@18 Mos		
Written Premium	0	0	0	0
Written Premium Accrued	0	0	0	0
Unearned Premium Current	0	0	0	0
Total Earned Premium	0	0	0	0
Reported Losses	0	0	0	0
I.B.N.R. Reserve	0	0	0	0
Total Incurred Losses	0	0	0	0
Loss Ratio	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
Ceding Expenses & Commissions	0	0	0	0
Ceding Expenses Accrued	0	0	0	0
Rate Deviation	0	0	0	0
Rate Deviation Expense All.	0	0	0	0
Deferred Acquisition Costs	0	0	0	0
Expense Ratio to Earned Premium	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
C.A.R. Underwriting Deficit	0	0	0	0
<b>Private Passenger ALL</b>	<b><u>PY 2017</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2016</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2015</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2014</u></b>
	@06 Mos	@18 Mos		
Written Premium	0	0	0	0
Written Premium Accrued	0	0	0	0
Unearned Premium Current	0	0	0	0
Total Earned Premium	0	0	0	0
Reported Losses	0	0	0	0
I.B.N.R. Reserve	0	0	0	0
Total Incurred Losses	0	0	0	0
Loss Ratio	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
Ceding Expenses & Commissions	0	0	0	0
Ceding Expenses Accrued	0	0	0	0
Rate Deviation	0	0	0	0
Rate Deviation Expense All.	0	0	0	0
Deferred Acquisition Costs	0	0	0	0
Expense Ratio to Earned Premium	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
C.A.R. Underwriting Deficit	0	0	0	0

QUARTER ENDING: JUNE 30, 2017

EXHIBIT # 3

PAGE 2 Of 4

<b>Private Passenger LIABILITY</b>	<b><u>PY 2013</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2012</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2011</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2010</u></b>
Written Premium	0	0	0	0
Written Premium Accrued	0	0	0	0
Unearned Premium Current	0	0	0	0
Total Earned Premium	0	0	0	0
Reported Losses	0	0	0	0
I.B.N.R. Reserve	0	0	0	0
Total Incurred Losses	0	0	0	0
Loss Ratio	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
Ceding Expenses & Commissions	0	0	0	0
Ceding Expenses Accrued	0	0	0	0
Rate Deviation	0	0	0	0
Rate Deviation Expense All.	0	0	0	0
Deferred Acquisition Costs	0	0	0	0
Expense Ratio to Earned Premium	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
C.A.R. Underwriting Deficit	0	0	0	0
<b>Private Passenger PHYSICAL DAMAGE</b>	<b><u>PY 2013</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2012</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2011</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2010</u></b>
Written Premium	0	0	0	0
Written Premium Accrued	0	0	0	0
Unearned Premium Current	0	0	0	0
Total Earned Premium	0	0	0	0
Reported Losses	0	0	0	0
I.B.N.R. Reserve	0	0	0	0
Total Incurred Losses	0	0	0	0
Loss Ratio	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
Ceding Expenses & Commissions	0	0	0	0
Ceding Expenses Accrued	0	0	0	0
Rate Deviation	0	0	0	0
Rate Deviation Expense All.	0	0	0	0
Deferred Acquisition Costs	0	0	0	0
Expense Ratio to Earned Premium	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
C.A.R. Underwriting Deficit	0	0	0	0
<b>Private Passenger ALL</b>	<b><u>PY 2013</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2012</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2011</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2010</u></b>
Written Premium	0	0	0	0
Written Premium Accrued	0	0	0	0
Unearned Premium Current	0	0	0	0
Total Earned Premium	0	0	0	0
Reported Losses	0	0	0	0
I.B.N.R. Reserve	0	0	0	0
Total Incurred Losses	0	0	0	0
Loss Ratio	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
Ceding Expenses & Commissions	0	0	0	0
Ceding Expenses Accrued	0	0	0	0
Rate Deviation	0	0	0	0
Rate Deviation Expense All.	0	0	0	0
Deferred Acquisition Costs	0	0	0	0
Expense Ratio to Earned Premium	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
C.A.R. Underwriting Deficit	0	0	0	0

QUARTER ENDING: JUNE 30, 2017

EXHIBIT # 3

PAGE 3 Of 4

<b>All Other LIABILITY</b>	<b><u>PY 2017</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2016</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2015</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2014</u></b>
	@06 Mos	@18 Mos		
Written Premium	68,526	128,239	113,819	98,439
Written Premium Accrued	0	0	0	0
Unearned Premium Current	51,593	17,000	0	0
Total Earned Premium	16,933	111,239	113,819	98,439
Reported Losses	7,086	76,167	83,273	73,927
I.B.N.R. Reserve	8,261	30,334	10,166	6,882
Total Incurred Losses	15,347	106,501	93,439	80,809
Loss Ratio	0.906	0.957	0.821	0.821
Ceding Expenses & Commissions	17,562	32,851	29,113	25,700
Ceding Expenses Accrued	0	0	0	0
Deferred Acquisition Costs	13,222	4,354	0	0
Expense Ratio to Earned Premium	0.256	0.256	0.256	0.261
C.A.R. Underwriting Deficit	(2,754)	(23,759)	(8,733)	(8,070)
<b>All Other PHYSICAL DAMAGE</b>	<b><u>PY 2017</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2016</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2015</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2014</u></b>
	@06 Mos	@18 Mos		
Written Premium	22,219	41,866	37,657	29,499
Written Premium Accrued	0	0	0	0
Unearned Premium Current	16,714	5,528	0	0
Total Earned Premium	5,505	36,338	37,657	29,499
Reported Losses	3,321	32,592	33,624	24,423
I.B.N.R. Reserve	1,260	(305)	(952)	318
Total Incurred Losses	4,581	32,287	32,672	24,741
Loss Ratio	0.832	0.889	0.868	0.839
Ceding Expenses & Commissions	5,729	10,787	9,679	7,752
Ceding Expenses Accrued	0	0	0	0
Deferred Acquisition Costs	4,309	1,424	0	0
Expense Ratio to Earned Premium	0.258	0.258	0.257	0.263
C.A.R. Underwriting Deficit	(496)	(5,312)	(4,694)	(2,994)
<b>All Other ALL</b>	<b><u>PY 2017</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2016</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2015</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2014</u></b>
	@06 Mos	@18 Mos		
Written Premium	90,745	170,105	151,476	127,938
Written Premium Accrued	0	0	0	0
Unearned Premium Current	68,307	22,528	0	0
Total Earned Premium	22,438	147,577	151,476	127,938
Reported Losses	10,407	108,759	116,897	98,350
I.B.N.R. Reserve	9,521	30,029	9,214	7,200
Total Incurred Losses	19,928	138,788	126,111	105,550
Loss Ratio	0.888	0.940	0.833	0.825
Ceding Expenses & Commissions	23,291	43,638	38,792	33,452
Ceding Expenses Accrued	0	0	0	0
Deferred Acquisition Costs	17,531	5,778	0	0
Expense Ratio to Earned Premium	0.257	0.257	0.256	0.261
C.A.R. Underwriting Deficit	(3,250)	(29,071)	(13,427)	(11,064)

QUARTER ENDING: JUNE 30, 2017

EXHIBIT # 3

PAGE 4 Of 4

<b>All Other LIABILITY</b>	<b><u>PY 2013</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2012</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2011</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2010</u></b>
Written Premium	86,656	74,631	70,343	72,872
Written Premium Accrued	0	0	0	0
Unearned Premium Current	0	0	0	0
Total Earned Premium	86,656	74,631	70,343	72,872
Reported Losses	73,467	61,591	55,240	53,586
I.B.N.R. Reserve	(1,143)	(1,045)	136	2
Total Incurred Losses	72,324	60,546	55,376	53,588
Loss Ratio	0.835	0.811	0.787	0.735
Ceding Expenses & Commissions	23,309	20,438	20,549	22,215
Ceding Expenses Accrued	0	0	0	0
Deferred Acquisition Costs	0	0	0	0
Expense Ratio to Earned Premium	0.269	0.274	0.292	0.305
C.A.R. Underwriting Deficit	(8,977)	(6,353)	(5,582)	(2,931)
<b>All Other PHYSICAL DAMAGE</b>	<b><u>PY 2013</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2012</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2011</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2010</u></b>
Written Premium	23,856	20,439	18,611	18,947
Written Premium Accrued	0	0	0	0
Unearned Premium Current	0	0	0	0
Total Earned Premium	23,856	20,439	18,611	18,947
Reported Losses	20,267	17,398	15,283	14,459
I.B.N.R. Reserve	(299)	0	0	0
Total Incurred Losses	19,968	17,398	15,283	14,459
Loss Ratio	0.837	0.851	0.821	0.763
Ceding Expenses & Commissions	6,475	5,657	6,062	6,838
Ceding Expenses Accrued	0	0	0	0
Deferred Acquisition Costs	0	0	0	0
Expense Ratio to Earned Premium	0.271	0.277	0.326	0.361
C.A.R. Underwriting Deficit	(2,587)	(2,616)	(2,734)	(2,350)
<b>All Other ALL</b>	<b><u>PY 2013</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2012</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2011</u></b>	<b><u>PY 2010</u></b>
Written Premium	110,512	95,070	88,954	91,819
Written Premium Accrued	0	0	0	0
Unearned Premium Current	0	0	0	0
Total Earned Premium	110,512	95,070	88,954	91,819
Reported Losses	93,734	78,989	70,523	68,045
I.B.N.R. Reserve	(1,442)	(1,045)	136	2
Total Incurred Losses	92,292	77,944	70,659	68,047
Loss Ratio	0.835	0.820	0.794	0.741
Ceding Expenses & Commissions	29,784	26,095	26,611	29,053
Ceding Expenses Accrued	0	0	0	0
Deferred Acquisition Costs	0	0	0	0
Expense Ratio to Earned Premium	0.270	0.274	0.299	0.316
C.A.R. Underwriting Deficit	(11,564)	(8,969)	(8,316)	(5,281)



















	<b>P.P. Bodily Injury</b>		<b>P.P. No Fault</b>		<b>P.P. Property Damage</b>		<b>P.P. Liability</b>	
	<u>AY 2009</u>	<u>AY 2008</u>	<u>AY 2009</u>	<u>AY 2008</u>	<u>AY 2009</u>	<u>AY 2008</u>	<u>AY 2009</u>	<u>AY 2008</u>
Ultimate Loss	26,058	66,291	8,644	19,753	20,049	51,832	54,751	137,876
Distrib Q-1	10,126	18,170	3,410	5,793	8,651	14,939		
from Q-2	8,175	18,247	2,484	5,232	5,826	14,383		
Avg. of Q-3	5,156	16,512	1,703	4,831	3,419	11,808		
Pd/Inc. Q-4	2,601	13,362	1,047	3,897	2,153	10,702		
Total	26,058	66,291	8,644	19,753	20,049	51,832		
Alternate Distribution:								
Q-1	0	0	0	0	0	0		
Q-2	0	0	0	0	0	0		
Q-3	0	0	0	0	0	0		
Q-4	0	0	0	0	0	0		
Total	0	0	0	0	0	0		
AY IBNR Q-1	(14)	0	0	(6)	0	0	(14)	(6)
Q-2	(4)	(27)	(2)	0	0	0	(6)	(27)
Q-3	(3)	(1)	0	(2)	0	0	(3)	(3)
Q-4	(1)	0	1	0	0	0	0	0
Total	(22)	(28)	(1)	(8)	0	0	(23)	(36)
CY Earn Prem	25,706	66,041	5,633	14,749	24,365	63,605	55,704	144,395
AY Loss Ratio	1.014	1.004	1.535	1.339	0.823	0.815	0.983	0.955
Prior Ratio	1.014	1.004	1.535	1.339	0.823	0.815	0.983	0.955
AY LR w/Rat Dev	0.933	0.971	1.417	1.294	0.774	0.793	0.913	0.926
Prior AY LR w/Rat Dev	0.933	0.971	1.417	1.293	0.774	0.793	0.914	0.926
<b>P.Y. IBNR</b>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>
Q-1	(14)	0	0	(6)	0	0	(14)	(6)
Q-2	(4)	(27)	(2)	0	0	0	(6)	(27)
Q-3	(3)	(1)	0	(2)	0	0	(3)	(3)
Q-4	(1)	0	1	0	0	0	0	0
Total	(22)	(28)	(1)	(8)	0	0	(23)	(36)
Shifted Amount	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Final PY IBNR	(22)	(28)	(1)	(8)	0	0	(23)	(36)
<b>PY Earn Prem</b>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>
PY Pd + OS Loss	9,007	47,470	1,986	10,485	8,483	45,480	19,476	103,435
PY PD/OS/IBNR	10,344	51,707	3,595	15,303	7,702	39,361	21,641	106,371
PY PD/OS/IBNR	10,322	51,679	3,594	15,295	7,702	39,361	21,618	106,335
PY Loss Ratio	1.146	1.089	1.810	1.459	0.908	0.865	1.110	1.028
Prior PY Loss Ratio	1.147	1.088	1.811	1.459	0.908	0.865	1.111	1.028
PY LR w/ RatDev	1.031	1.018	1.639	1.362	0.839	0.822	1.011	0.968
Prior PY LR w/ RatDev	1.032	1.018	1.640	1.362	0.839	0.822	1.012	0.968

	<b>P.P. Collision</b>		<b>P.P. Comprehensive</b>		<b>P.P. Physical Damage</b>		<b>Total Priv. Passenger</b>	
	<u>AY 2009</u>	<u>AY 2008</u>	<u>AY 2009</u>	<u>AY 2008</u>	<u>AY 2009</u>	<u>AY 2008</u>	<u>AY 2009</u>	<u>AY 2008</u>
Ultimate Loss	19,034	49,895	7,732	18,816	26,766	68,711	81,517	206,587
Distrib Q-1	8,920	15,969	2,938	5,220				
from Q-2	4,672	12,520	2,342	4,928				
Avg. of Q-3	3,279	10,879	1,591	4,799				
Pd/Inc. Q-4	2,163	10,527	861	3,869				
Total	19,034	49,895	7,732	18,816				
Alternate Distribution:								
Q-1	0	0	0	0				
Q-2	0	0	0	0				
Q-3	0	0	0	0				
Q-4	0	0	0	0				
Total	0	0	0	0				
AY IBNR Q-1	0	0	0	0	0	0	(14)	(6)
Q-2	0	0	0	0	0	0	(6)	(27)
Q-3	0	0	0	0	0	0	(3)	(3)
Q-4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total	0	0	0	0	0	0	(23)	(36)
CY Earn Prem	19,899	51,330	7,217	16,407	27,116	67,737	82,820	212,132
AY Loss Ratio	0.957	0.972	1.071	1.147	0.987	1.014	0.984	0.974
Prior Ratio	0.957	0.972	1.071	1.147	0.987	1.014	0.984	0.974
AY LR w/Rat Dev	0.904	0.950	0.962	1.099	0.920	0.986	0.916	0.945
Prior AY LR w/Rat Dev	0.904	0.950	0.962	1.099	0.920	0.986	0.916	0.945
<b>P.Y. IBNR</b>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>
Q-1	0	0	0	0	0	0	(14)	(6)
Q-2	0	0	0	0	0	0	(6)	(27)
Q-3	0	0	0	0	0	0	(3)	(3)
Q-4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total	0	0	0	0	0	0	(23)	(36)
Shifted Amount	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Final PY IBNR	0	0	0	0	0	0	(23)	(36)
	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>	<u>PY 2009</u>	<u>PY 2008</u>
PY Earn Prem	6,785	36,532	2,535	12,426	9,320	48,958	28,796	152,393
PY Pd + OS Loss	6,755	37,738	2,717	14,527	9,472	52,265	31,113	158,636
PY PD/OS/IBNR	6,755	37,738	2,717	14,527	9,472	52,265	31,090	158,600
PY Loss Ratio	0.996	1.033	1.072	1.169	1.016	1.068	1.080	1.041
Prior PY Loss Ratio	0.996	1.033	1.072	1.169	1.016	1.068	1.080	1.041
PY LR w/ RatDev	0.931	0.987	0.939	1.070	0.934	1.009	0.986	0.981
Prior PY LR w/ RatDev	0.931	0.987	0.939	1.070	0.934	1.009	0.987	0.981

























COMMERCIAL ULTIMATE POLICY YEAR DEFICIT PROJECTIONS  
 BASED ON DATA REPORTED THROUGH QUARTER ENDING JUNE 2017  
 (000's OMITTED)

DOCKET #: LR 17.07  
 EXHIBIT #: 11  
 PAGE: 1 of 2

SUMMARY EXHIBIT

	Policy Year 2014		Policy Year 2015		Policy Year 2016	
	Dollars	% Prem	Dollars	% Prem	Dollars	% Prem
Premium	127,938	100.0%	151,500	100.0%	169,500	100.0%
Losses Incurred and ALAE	105,550	82.5%	126,200	83.3%	159,330	94.0%
Underwriting Expenses	33,452	26.1%	38,784	25.6%	43,266	25.5%
Underwriting Result	(11,064)	-8.6%	(13,484)	-8.9%	(33,096)	-19.5%

COMPARISON OF ULTIMATE POLICY YEAR DEFICIT PROJECTIONS  
PRIOR AND CURRENT QUARTER ESTIMATES

DOCKET #: LR 17.07  
EXHIBIT #: 11  
PAGE: 2 of 2

Policy Year 2016

	Prior Qtr Estimate		Current Qtr Estimate		Variance	
	Dollars	% Prem	Dollars	% Prem	Dollars	Percent
Premium	169,600	100.0%	169,500	100.0%	(100)	-0.1%
Losses Incurred and ALAE	156,541	92.3%	159,330	94.0%	2,789	1.8%
Underwriting Expenses	43,291	25.5%	43,266	25.5%	(25)	-0.1%
Underwriting Result	(30,232)	-17.8%	(33,096)	-19.5%	(2,864)	9.5%

Policy Year 2015

	Prior Qtr Estimate		Current Qtr Estimate		Variance	
	Dollars	% Prem	Dollars	% Prem	Dollars	Percent
Premium	151,500	100.0%	151,500	100.0%	0	0.0%
Losses Incurred and ALAE	126,351	83.4%	126,200	83.3%	(151)	-0.1%
Underwriting Expenses	38,784	25.6%	38,784	25.6%	0	0.0%
Underwriting Result	(13,635)	-9.0%	(13,484)	-8.9%	151	-1.1%

Policy Year 2014

	Prior Qtr Estimate		Current Qtr Estimate		Variance	
	Dollars	% Prem	Dollars	% Prem	Dollars	Percent
Premium	127,938	100.0%	127,938	100.0%	0	0.0%
Losses Incurred and ALAE	104,121	81.4%	105,550	82.5%	1,429	1.4%
Underwriting Expenses	33,452	26.1%	33,452	26.1%	0	0.0%
Underwriting Result	(9,635)	-7.5%	(11,064)	-8.6%	(1,429)	14.8%